

Human Health Risk Assessment (HHRA) - Flin Flon / Creighton Technical Advisory Committee (TAC)

August 19, 2008
Teleconference

Attendance

MB Conservation: Dave Bezak, Mike Gilbertson, Geoff Jones
MB Health & Healthy Living: Marcia Anderson, Karen Serwonka
MB STEM: None
MB Water Stewardship: None
SERM: George Bihun, Dale Kristoff
SK Health: James Irvine
Health Canada: Lindsay Smith
HBMS: Ian Cooper, Alan Hair, Shirley Neault
Intrinsic Environmental: Elliot Sigal, Adam Safruk
Facilitator: Sheldon McLeod
Observers: None

Introduction

- The agenda was reviewed and accepted.
- The notes from the previous meeting (July 17) were reviewed and approved.
- A review of action items from the previous meeting was conducted as noted in the action tables.

#	Action	Responsibility	Target Date	Status
024	Provide references for adjustment factors to TAC.	Elliot Sigal	2008-08-31	2007-12-06, new 2008-07-17, ongoing 2008-08-19, Complete

Update on Human Health Risk Assessment

Food Survey

- The collection of fish has been ongoing since last week and is scheduled for completion at the end of this week. The blueberries were collected by one of the CAC members.

Bioaccessibility

- The report is expected by the end of this week.

Toxicity Profiles

- Five of the 6 profiles have been circulated for review. The last one (lead) is expected within the week.

Drinking Water

- The final report has been posted on the website.

Snow

- Clarification was provided on previous comments and these will be reviewed further (see action #079)

Indoor Dust

- The supplemental dust sampling data has been reviewed and a memo from Intrinsik was previously circulated. Several issues with the validity of the data were noted. Highlights of the initial data are:
 - Two locations recorded elevated lead and tin levels. The lead-tin correlation is odd and existed in all of the homes.
 - The remaining 36 locations are similar to non-point source cities, with the exception of zinc and copper.
 - The correlation between soil and dust results is not present, nor is there corresponding geographical dispersion.
- The above noted issues are currently under investigation with the samples being reanalyzed at a different lab, while speciation of the samples at yet another lab is also underway. Discussions with the Health Departments are also ongoing.
- The overall schedule is impacted by this issue (2-3 weeks at present; 2-3 months if resampling is required).

Comment: The timing of the wipe sample collection does not match this collection of dust samples.

Response: That is correct; however this would not be anticipated to have a significant impact.

Comment: There could be home hobbies, etcetera occurring in the homes.

Response: None have been noted at this time.

Comment: These could be older homes with leaded paint.

Response: Of the two homes, one is new and the other was recently renovated and had new carpets installed.

Question: Was this the same lab as the one that analyzed the snow?

Response: Yes

Question: Were the homes sampled the residences of Smelter workers?

Response: Some of them were, but HBMS has occupational hygiene practices programs in place to prevent the transfer of work conditions to the home. There is also no tin associated with HBMS operations.

Air

- The data from the increased analysis of HBMS' regular ambient air monitoring program has not yet been supplied. This data will be used in the HHRA and made available to TAC members.

#	Action	Responsibility	Target Date	Status
065	Evaluate the use of the South Main soil sample result in the mapping (in consultation with TAC members)	Geoff Jones	2008-08-19	2008-07-17, new 2008-08-19, Complete NOTE: sample is in current mapping and will remain in
066	Revise the Gantt chart to reflect 2-week delay with bioaccessibility work	Elliot Sigal	2008-08-20	2008-07-17, new 2008-08-19, ongoing

#	Action	Responsibility	Target Date	Status
067	Talk to MB Fisheries about expediting a collection permit for the fish sampling portion of the food study	Dave Green	2008-07-31	2008-07-17, new 2008-08-19, Complete
068	Follow up on suggestion to share data gathered by MB Water Stewardship from fish sampling program planned for Schist, Athapap & Rocky Lakes	Dave Green / Elliot Sigal	2008-07-31	2008-07-17, new 2008-08-19, Complete (Data sharing is happening)
069	Provide a specific lake located NW of the plant for consideration as a lake to include while fish sampling	George Bihun	2008-07-18	2008-07-17, new 2008-08-19, Complete (the lake is included)
070	Provide comments on the final draft of the drinking water report	TAC Members	2008-07-24	2008-07-17, new 2008-08-19, Complete
079	Review draft snow report in light of clarified comments	Alan Hair	2008-08-29	2008-08-19, new

Peer Review Panel

The recommendation for the selection of the peer review panel was accepted. Therefore the process will be:

- to avoid any real or perceived conflict of interest, the peer review will be guided by and accountable to primarily the government members of TAC;
- an independent third party will be retained to coordinate and oversee the operation of the external expert review panel;
- HBMS will undertake the administrative function to develop and let an RFP, subject to the approval of the forum, to identify parties and their approach/capacity to potentially serve as the independent third party coordinator;
- the choice of independent third party will be made by the government members of TAC,
- HBMS will retain the chosen third party to manage and oversee the review panel operation subject to processes agreed to by government members of TAC; and
- the report from the review panel will be delivered to the TAC.

Activities of the Communications Working Group

- There are no recent activities from this group to report.

CAC Feedback

- There has not been a meeting of the CAC, nor were the observers present.

#	Action	Responsibility	Target Date	Status
071	Craft a response to the CAC regarding ecological risk assessment	Dave Bezak / George Bihun	2008-08-29	2008-07-17, new 2008-08-19, ongoing
072	Compile a summary of the current ecological work being done to present to the CAC	Alan Hair	2008-08-29	2008-07-17, new 2008-08-19, ongoing

#	Action	Responsibility	Target Date	Status
073	Provide the response to the ecological risk assessment question to the CAC	Alan Hair	2008-09-10	2008-07-17, new 2008-08-19, ongoing
074	Arrange a meeting to discuss / plan for biological monitoring	James Irvine/Susan Roberecki	2008-09-15	2008-07-17, new 2008-08-19, ongoing

Public Engagement

- This item was not discussed at this meeting.

Other Business

- A request from a PhD student to use the soil data points in his thesis was received. Given the privacy agreements made with the homeowners whose yards were sampled, the TAC did not deem this request as appropriate. The Government of Manitoba has agreed to supply the data from their 2006 surface soil study.
- One query was received since the last TAC teleconference. The resident wanted to know if it was safe to eat local blueberries. The information from the data gap analysis was provided to the resident and seemed to satisfy the concern.

#	Action	Responsibility	Target Date	Status
064	Seek advice from the webmaster for posting public comments / responses	Alan Hair	2008-06-30	2008-06-05, new 2008-07-17, ongoing 2008-08-19, Complete
075	Post finalized revision of the Terms of Reference on the website	Alan Hair	2008-07-21	2008-07-17, new 2008-08-19, Complete
076	Provide information from other Intrinsic studies regarding peer review panel selection	Elliot Sigal	2008-07-18	2008-07-17, new 2008-08-19, Complete
077	Recommend how the peer review panel will be selected	George Bihun / Dave Bezak	2008-08-08	2008-07-17, new 2008-08-19, Complete
078	Provide text for expanding the answer to the cancer question in the CAC notes of June 17	James Irvine	2008-07-18	2008-07-17, new 2008-08-19, Complete

NEXT MEETINGS: **September 4, 2:00 pm**
Teleconference / Boardroom A

Tentative: September 25, 2:00 pm
Teleconference / Boardroom A