

Human Health Risk Assessment (HHRA) - Flin Flon / Creighton Community Advisory Committee (CAC)

April 15, 2009 – Flin Flon City Hall
Meeting #9

Attendance

Community Advisory Committee (CAC) Membership					
Don Aasen Town of Creighton	X	Bev Hill NorMan Regional Health		Deb Odegaard FF&D Env't Council	X
Robert Bratvold Creighton School Board	X	Tom Lindsey Steelworkers Union	X	Bill Pauley Flin Flon School Division	X
Katie Garinger General Public	X	Charlene Logan MCRRHA	X	Dave Price Green Project	X
Ian Cooper HBMS	X	Barb Lyons General Public	X	Bill Hanson City of Flin Flon	X
Cheryl Hordal General Public	X	Christa McIntyre Healthy Flin Flon			

Guests / Other		
Sheldon McLeod (Facilitator) S.L. McLeod Consulting	Shirley Neault (Recorder) HBMS	Elliot Sigal (via telephone) Intrinsik Environmental
TAC Members (Observer) SK Government MB Government	Alan Hair HBMS	Dr. James Irvine Mamawetan Churchill River Health Region
Dr. Susan Roberecki (via telephone) MB Health and Healthy Living	Dr. Lawrence Elliott NOR-MAN Health Region	Jacqueline Patterson (via telephone) Toxicology Excellence for Risk Assessment (TERA)
1 Public Observer		

Introduction

- Facilitator Sheldon McLeod called the meeting to order and reviewed the agenda.
- A review of the draft notes of the previous meeting was conducted. The notes were approved.
- Action Items from the previous meeting were reviewed. The status of these action items is summarized in the tables at the end of these notes.

Member's Commentary – Community Feedback

- Each CAC member was given the opportunity to share what they are hearing in the community regarding the HHRA. The only comment was that it has been very quiet. A few questions were also raised during this agenda item:

Question: Has Intrinsik ever looked into the impact of metals on behavioural issues with children?

Response: The overall relationship between lead and cognitive ability was part of the extensive literature review as part of the HHRA, but no specific study of populations relating cognitive function development with metals has been done by Intrinsik. The population size would impact statistical reliability. Behavioural issues are harder to measure and a study of this nature is something that Health Canada or a university could undertake (see action #037).

Question: Is there any new information related to the mercury in water results discussed in recent newspaper articles?

Response: The consultant's water data was supplementary to the mercury in fish study and was therefore not a fully designed lake water study. Previous Environmental Effects Monitoring (EEM) studies did not find mercury in water. Both the consultant's results and the results from the resampling conducted by Manitoba Conservation were considered in the HHRA. More lake water samples will be collected by both MB Conservation and the consultant this summer. The Water Stewardship data could be supplied to this group (see action #038).

HHRA Update – Elliot Sigal, Intrinsik Environmental

Reference Documentation – Intrinsik - HHRA Update April 15, 2009

- The draft HHRA report is currently under review by the TAC and the Independent Expert Review Panel (IERP). The IERP process includes documentation review by the panel members, a meeting that Intrinsik will attend to provide clarification to the panel as necessary and to understand concerns that the panel may raise, and a final report. Intrinsik will then finalize the report with results anticipated for CAC and public release in December 2009 or January 2010. Risk management planning is also underway so that the plans are ready should they be required.

Independent Peer Review Process

Reference Documentation – TERA - Intro to CAC 15 April 2009

- A presentation was made by Ms. Jacqueline Patterson from Toxicology Excellence for Risk Assessment (TERA) regarding the IERP process:
 - Independence is essential for a credible review. Therefore, communication with HBMS is limited to establishing a contract and invoicing. All other communications with TERA are through a designated contact person (Sheldon).
 - TERA is conducting a scientific screening of the HHRA documents and selecting the IERP from a pool of appropriate expert candidates. A key part of the selection process is ensuring that there are no conflicts of interest.

Question: How many panel members will there be?

Response: Approximately 10.

Question: What is the make-up of the panel? Are they from government agencies? Are they academics?

Response: Panel members will likely be consultants or come from various agencies.

Question: Are there health experts?

Response: Human health, risk assessment and toxicology experts are currently being sought.

Question: Following the panel meeting in June, what is the timeline for the next steps?

Response: It will take 3-4 weeks to draft the panel's report, which will then go to the TAC and Intrinsik. The report will be revised as necessary by Intrinsik. The revised report will be returned to TERA to ensure that the panel's issues and concerns have been addressed. It will then be available to the CAC.

Further Evaluation of Environmental Exposure

Reference Documentation – Creighton Flin Flon Presentation Human Exp Assess April 15

- The Medical Health Officers from Mamawetan Churchill River and NOR-MAN Health Regions were in attendance at the meeting and supported by the Deputy Chief Medical Health Officer from Manitoba Health and Healthy Living via telephone. They presented a status update on plans for further evaluation of environmental exposures that may be required as a next step in the HHRA process:
 - Planning is underway for the potential of a community evaluation in the fall of 2009.
 - The evaluation will be overseen by a subcommittee of the TAC which reports to the TAC.
 - The steps for the evaluation include developing the plan, peer reviewing the protocol, gathering input from the CAC, submission for ethics review, deciding what, where and who to proceed, communicating to the public and implementing the plan.

Question: What if the HHRA process does not think that biomonitoring is required but the community does? Who gets the final call?
Response: Feedback will be provided to both the TAC and the CAC for decisions to be made.

Question: What ethical concerns may need to be addressed?
Response: Risks versus benefits need to be weighed to rationalize and justify conducting physical tests. Consent for testing will need to be obtained. The ethical review will also cover how to deal with potential anxiety while awaiting test results and plans for dealing with results.

Question: What would the sample size be?
Response: All details need to be determined, which is why the team of experts has been developed.

Question: Which metals are measured via blood and urine?
Response: Typically mercury and lead are measured in blood while arsenic is typically measured in urine.

Question: Will the CAC get input into the plan at the next meeting?
Response: Yes and ideally the input will be gathered prior to ethics review.

Question: Could the draft plan be circulated to the members prior to the meeting?
Response: Yes.

Question: If this plan proceeds as described, the communication will precede the viewing of the HHRA report by the CAC members. How will the members then answer questions from the public?
Response: The Environmental Exposure team needs to consider this issue when preparing the communication. Some members of the team could attend the next meeting to provide background data.

Soil Improvement Update

- The MB Government had clean soil placed at North Avenue and Foster Parks last fall. These areas will have sod placed on them this spring.
- The remaining eight parks are currently up for tender. Completion of the more work is planned for 2009 and into 2010 if necessary.

#	Action	Responsibility	Target Date	Status
032	Offer suggestions for engaging the public when the final report is ready	CAC Members	2008-10-15	2008-06-17, new 2008-09-10, ongoing 2008-11-19, ongoing 2009-04-15, ongoing
036	Conduct a literature search to provide specific sites of other fish studies	Elliot Sigal	2008-11-24	2008-11-19, new 2009-04-15, ongoing
037	Check if Health Canada has information regarding metals and children's behavioural issues	Susan Roberecki	2009-05-29	2009-04-15, new
038	Circulate MB Water Stewardship information to CAC	Sheldon McLeod	2009-04-30	2009-04-15, new

**NEXT MEETING: Monday, June 1, 2009 from 6:30 pm – 8:30 pm
Location: FF City Hall**