

# Human Health Risk Assessment (HHRA) - Flin Flon / Creighton Community Advisory Committee (CAC)

December 6, 2007 – Flin Flon City Hall Council Chambers  
Meeting #3

## Attendance

Community Advisory Committee (CAC) Membership					
Don Aasen Town of Creighton	X	Shelly Jones General Public	X	Deb Odegaard FF&D Env't Council	X
Rob Bratvold Creighton School Board		Tom Lindsey Steelworkers Union	X	Bill Pauley Flin Flon School Division	
Ian Cooper HBMS	X	Charlene Logan MCRRHA	X	Dave Price Green Project	X
Cheryl Hordal General Public	X	Barb Lyons General Public	X	Tom Therien City of Flin Flon	
Bev Hill NorMan Regional Health	X	Christa McIntyre Healthy Flin Flon	X		

Guests / Other		
James Irvine (Guest) Saskatchewan Health	Shirley Neault (Recorder) HBMS	Sheldon McLeod (Facilitator) S.L. McLeod Consulting
Marcia Anderson (Guest) Manitoba Health	Elliot Sigal (Guest) Intrinsic Environmental	Several TAC members (Observers) MB & SK governments
Susan Roberecki (Guest via phone) Manitoba Health	Adam Safruk (Guest) Intrinsic Environmental	Several members of the public (Observers)

## Introduction

- Facilitator Sheldon McLeod greeted the members of the public present at the meeting and discussed the meeting arrangements. The public is witnessing the meeting and, if time permits, questions from them may be accepted.
- A review of the draft notes of both previous meetings was conducted and both sets of notes were approved for posting on the website, while noting that:
  - Consensus was not reached respecting the right of the CAC to close portions of the meetings.
- Action Items from the previous meeting were reviewed. The status of these action items is summarized in the table at the end of these notes.

## Communications Working Group Update

- The meeting minutes from the first CWG meeting were shared with the CAC members. The Labour Temple was subsequently volunteered to be another location for the planned information booths. Other possible locations discussed included the Regional Health Authority and the Provincial Government Building.
- The CWG was also asked to look into more links to and from the City of Flin Flon and HudBay Minerals Inc. pages.

## Member's Commentary – Community Feedback

- Each CAC member was given the opportunity to share what they are hearing in the community regarding the HHRA. Comments included:

- There were 4 or 5 centenarians in attendance at the recent Senior's Christmas Party who all indicated that they had raised their families in the Flin Flon area and did not think that health was an issue.
- There seems to be good awareness that the study is being done and people are generally happy that it is being done and are looking forward to the results.
- One of the residents that had the dust survey done in their home commented on the length of time that it took to collect the samples.
- Comments appear to be from one extreme to the other – "shut-up or HB will shut down" to "it's about time".
- Several positive comments regarding the study have been made, yet there is confusion as to what the study entails (i.e. risk assessment versus health study).
- The professional conduct of the samplers was noted.
- Some members were questioned about the recent news of the Smelter shut-down as it relates to the HHRA. Responses were given by those CAC members indicating that metals in soil have nothing to do with sulphur dioxide emissions. Some members were also asked if the study was required given the possible Smelter shut-down. Again, answers were given by those CAC members that this study is about metals already present in the soil.
- Some suspicions were raised respecting the timing of the original MB Conservation study considering the Smelter announcement and concern about jobs and the general economy of the community.
- Members have been questioned about real estate values.
- In general, there is not a lot of communication regarding the study although some members thought that there would be.
- An idea to collect and analyze snow samples was raised.

#	Action	Responsibility	Target Date	Status
018	Put together and circulate a proposal regarding snow sampling for review and comment from the other members	Dave Price	2007-12-14	2007-12-06, new

**Presentation – Manitoba and Saskatchewan Departments of Health – Marcia Anderson and James Irvine**

- A presentation was provided on existing health data for the region compared to other locations in Manitoba and Saskatchewan.

Question: Were the numbers presented regarding deaths taken only from deaths at the Flin Flon General Hospital or did they include all residents regardless of where their deaths occurred?

Response: The numbers presented include all deaths of area residents.

Question: How did the health studies referenced consider environmental factors?

Response: The Health Departments tried to pull relevant statistics wherever possible, but the small population does not make statistical relevance easy. Therefore the data is reassuring but not absolute. The Health Departments hope that the HHRA will narrow the focus to determine the next steps, if any, to be taken.

Question: Mercury and cadmium were not discussed in the presentation. What data is available concerning these metals?

Response: Again, statistical relevance makes it difficult to pinpoint these specific metals, especially cadmium which has strong links to smoking.

Question: Can you test for mercury?

Response: Yes, although urine studies focus on mercury ingestion through fish and not from soil.

- A discussion ensued regarding mortality rates. The rates include occupational health disease factors, which drive the rates up. In other words, exposures are counterbalanced by worker health factors.

Question: Is there a chance for mercury to build-up in the body and not be disposed of in urine? If so, can tissue samples be taken to determine mercury levels?

Response: Different chemicals have different tests that are the best for determining health impacts.

### **Presentation – Criteria Comparison Table – Elliot Sigal, Intrinsic Environmental**

Reference Documentation - Intrinsic – Criteria Comparison Table (handout)

- A discussion to clarify information in the table was held:
  - - means no information
  - SQG stands for soil quality guideline
  - Lower numbers are better
  - CCME numbers (and all others) are scientifically defensible and conservative

Question: Is the intention to use CCME numbers or others?

Response: CCME numbers will be used where available as is the practice in both Manitoba and Saskatchewan. Where there is no available CCME number, others will be used that were formed on the same basis as the CCME numbers (i.e. 20% exposure from soil is used as the trigger number). If necessary, guidance would be sought from the TAC but Ontario or US numbers would be looked at first.

- The final numbers in the CCME guidelines consider both ecological (harm to plant life) and human health. For this study, the human health numbers will be used.

### **Sampling Update – Elliot Sigal, Intrinsic Environmental**

- The sample collection is complete and the samples are now at the labs being analyzed. The data should be available in mid to late January in the form of a draft report.

Question: Is the early cold weather (and hence closed windows) a factor for the dust sampling program?

Response: Not likely as the dust would be present regardless and the metals contained in that dust is the important part. Samplers actively looked for dust.

- A comment was made regarding the early snow cover on the tailings pond perhaps influencing this year as being a non-typical year. HBMS' efforts with dust control methods including backing up water were also mentioned as factors.

Question: How does dust get differentiated (e.g. dust from paper towels, etc.)?

Response: Metals in dust is the focus. There aren't many household activities that contribute to the presence of metals. The only metal potentially impacted by the average home is lead and cross samples were collected to control that factor.

### **Draft Review - Food Consumption Survey**

Reference Documentation - Intrinsic – Draft Survey (handout)

- The TAC also reviewed this draft survey at their meeting earlier in the day. They asked for a paragraph explaining the survey objectives to aid them in supplying comments. They also asked that

comments from the CAC be made by December 21 and that the Communications Working Group polish the survey.

#	Action	Responsibility	Target Date	Status
020	Add a paragraph to the food consumption survey explaining objectives	Elliot Sigal	2007-12-12	2007-12-06, new
021	Provide comments to Sheldon on the draft food consumption survey	CAC	2007-12-21	2007-12-06, new
022	Polish the food consumption survey	Communications Working Group	2008-01-15	2007-12-06, new

### **Technical Advisory Committee Update – Tom Lindsey**

- The TAC meeting was held earlier today. Topics discussed included:
  - The process going forward - a flow chart will be developed
  - Water quality
  - Present versus past exposures
  - Biological monitoring
  - Relatability between TAC and CAC

### **Committee Operations**

- The review of the draft Terms of Reference was postponed until the next meeting.
- A discussion was held regarding whether the CAC had appropriate diversity.
  - The Flin Flon Indian Métis Centre indicated that they had a Public Liaison Officer available to contribute to this group, if necessary.
  - It was noted that no Youth groups were present. The school division representatives were unfortunately not in attendance at this meeting.
- It was decided that the fact sheets provided by the Manitoba and Saskatchewan Health Departments could be circulated through various people / organizations.

#	Action	Responsibility	Target Date	Status
023	Make more copies of the MB and SK fact sheets produced by the Health Departments and make available for circulation through various people and organizations	Bev Hill	2007-12-20	2007-12-06, new

**NEXT MEETING:            Tentatively February 4 or 5 from 6:00 pm – 8:00 pm  
Venue to be confirmed**

## Human Health Risk Assessment (HHRA) - Flin Flon / Creighton Community Advisory Committee (CAC) Action Register

December 6, 2007

#	Action	Responsibility	Target Date	Status
005	Provide the CAC with contact information of similar groups from other HHRA studies.	Elliot Sigal, Alan Hair, Darren Keam	2007-11-22	2007-11-01, new 2007-12-06, ongoing
006	Arrange for representatives of the provincial Health Departments to be present for the next meeting.	Sheldon McLeod	2007-12-06	2007-11-01, new 2007-12-06, <b>Complete</b>
007	Provide Darren Keam with contact information for local public and private daycares.	Deb Odegaard	2007-11-05	2007-11-01, new 2007-12-06, <b>Complete</b>
008	Formal, written request to be made of local public and private daycares respecting involvement with the indoor dust sampling program.	Darren Keam	2007-11-09	2007-11-01, new 2007-12-06, <b>Complete</b>
009	Formal, written request to be made of local schools respecting involvement with the indoor dust sampling program.	Darren Keam	2007-11-09	2007-11-01, new 2007-12-06, <b>Complete</b>
010	Formal, written inquiry to be made of the City of Flin Flon respecting residential development timeline.	Darren Keam	2007-11-09	2007-11-01, new 2007-12-06, <b>Complete</b>
012	Develop a draft questionnaire respecting consumption of local food sources.	Elliot Sigal	2007-11-22	2007-11-01, new 2007-12-06, <b>Complete</b>
013	Arrange a large venue for the next meeting to accommodate public observers.	Ian Cooper	2007-12-06	2007-11-01, new 2007-12-06, <b>Complete</b>
014	Distribute comments received from Saskatchewan Health to the rest of the CAC.	Sheldon McLeod	2007-11-15	2007-11-01, new 2007-12-06, <b>Complete</b>
015	Arrange to fax all CAC correspondence to Charlene Logan.	Sheldon McLeod	2007-11-01	2007-11-01, new 2007-12-06, <b>Complete</b>
016	Arrange meeting of the Communications Working Group.	Alan Hair	2007-11-08	2007-11-01, new 2007-12-06, <b>Complete</b>
017	Future meeting agendas to include a round table regarding community feedback on the HHRA.	Sheldon McLeod	2007-12-06	2007-11-01, new 2007-12-06, <b>Complete</b>
018	Put together and circulate a proposal regarding snow sampling for review and comment from the other members	Dave Price	2007-12-14	2007-12-06, new
019	Circulate presentation delivered by MB and SK Health	Marcia Anderson James Irvine	2007-12-20	2007-12-06, new
020	Add a paragraph to the food consumption survey explaining objectives	Elliot Sigal	2007-12-12	2007-12-06, new

021	Provide comments to Sheldon on the draft food consumption survey	CAC	2007-12-21	2007-12-06, new
022	Polish the food consumption survey	Communications Working Group	2008-01-15	2007-12-06, new
023	Make more copies of the MB and SK fact sheets produced by the Health Departments and make available for circulation through various people and organizations	Bev Hill	2007-12-20	2007-12-06, new