

# **APPENDIX C**

# LITERATURE REVIEW AND DATA GAP ANALYSIS SUPPLEMENTAL DATA





# **APPENDIX C:**

# LITERATURE REVIEW, DATA GAP ANALYSIS, AND SUPPLEMENTAL DATA

## **Table of Contents**

Page

C-1.0	LITERATURE REVIEW SUMMARIES	C-1
C-1.1	Soil Data	C-1
C-1.2	Air Data	C-8
C-1.3	Home Garden Data	C-10
C-1.4	Drinking Water Data	C-12
C-1.5	Fish and Sediment Data	C-14
C-1.6	Surface Water Data	C-19
C-1.7	Blueberry Data	C-22

# List of Tables

Table C- 1	Description of Sampling Locations within the Blueberry Sampling Study	5
Table C-2	Summary of Maximum Soil Concentrations Found at Each Sampling	5
Table C-3	Location and Description of Home Garden Plots	
Table C-4	Summary of Maximum Soil Concentrations Found at Each Garden Plot (µq/q)	6
Table C-5	Location and Description of Forest Soil Sampling Locations	7
Table C-6	Summary of Maximum Soil Concentrations Found at Forest Sampling Sites in 1998; 1999 (µg/g)	7
Table C-7	Summary of Maximum Soil Concentrations Found at Forest Sampling Site in 2003 (µg/g)	7
Table C-8	Annual Average Metal Concentrations Associated with PM <sub>10</sub> in Ambient Air (µg/m <sup>3</sup> )	8
Table C-9	Annual Average Metal Concentrations Associated with TSP in Ambient Air (ug/m <sup>3</sup> )	9
Table C-10	Summary of Recent Drinking Water Data for Samples Taken from a	
	Treated Tap at the Flin Flon Water Treatment Plant (µg/L)	12
Table C-11	Concentrations of Metals in Treated Drinking Water for Flin Flin	
	from 2000 (µg/L total metals)	13
Table C-12	Concentrations of Metals in Treated Drinking Water for Flin Flin	
	from 2002 to 2006 (µg/L total metals)	13
Table C-13	Concentrations of Metals Measured in the Creighton Distribution	10
<b>T</b> 11 <b>O</b> 44	System in 2005 and 2006 (µg/L total)	
Table C-14	Summary of Mean Concentrations of Metals within the	45
Table C 15	Noon Concentrations of Motols in the Musels Tippus of	15
Table C-15	Northern Pike and White Sucker (ug/g w w)	16
Table C-16	Concentrations of Metals $(\mu q/q w w)$ in the Liver of Northern	10
	Pike and White Sucker from Hamell and Cliff Lakes in 1976	
	and 1982	
Table C-17	Sediment Chemistry Data for Ross Lake (µg/g)	



# **APPENDIX C:**

# LITERATURE REVIEW, DATA GAP ANALYSIS, AND SUPPLEMENTAL DATA

#### **Table of Contents**

#### Page

Table C-18	Sediment Chemistry Data for Schist Lake (µg/g)	18
TableC-19	Concentrations of Metals in the Tissues of Fish from Schist	
	Lake Sampled in August 1994 (µg/g)	
Table C-20	Concentrations of Metals in the Tissues of Fish from	
	Schist Lake Sampled in October 1994 (µg/g)	19
Table C-21	Maximum Surface Water Concentrations Measured in Areas	
	Affected by HBMS Discharge and Selected Reference	
	Areas (µg/L)	
Table C-22	Concentrations of Metals (µg/L) Found in Surface Waters of Ross	
	Lake and Flin Flon Creek.	21
Table C-23	Surface Water Chemistry Data for Ross Lake (mg/L)	21
Table C-24	Surface Water Chemistry Data for Schist Lake (mg/L)	22
Table C-25	Concentrations of Total Metals in Surface Water of Douglas	
	Lake in August 1993	
Table C-26	Mercury Concentrations (µg/g, wet and dry weight) in Blueberries	
	in Flin Flon Manitoba at Select Distances from the HBMS Complex	23
Table C-27	Lead Concentrations (ug/g, wet and dry weight) in Blueberries	
	in Flin Flon Manitoba at Select Distances from the HBMS Complex	24
Table C-28	Mercury Concentrations (ug/g, wet and dry weight) in Blueberries	
	in Flin Flon Manitoba at Select Distances from the Hudson Bay	
	Mining and Smelting Complex	25
Table C-29	Lead Concentrations (ug/g, dry weight) in Blueberries in Flin Flon	20
	Manitoba at Select Distances from the HBMS Complex	25
Table C-30	Concentrations (ug/g, dry weight) of Various Elements in	
	Blueberries in Flin Flon Manitoba at Select Distances from the	
	Hudson Bay Mining and Smelting Complex	26
Table C-31	Concentrations of Lead and Mercury in Blueberries from the	20
	Elin Elon Aroa	77
	ו ווו ו ועוו תוכמ	



# APPENDIX C: LITERATURE REVIEW, DATA GAP ANALYSIS, AND SUPPLEMENTAL DATA

# C-1.0 LITERATURE REVIEW SUMMARIES

Summaries and comments on individual papers and resources reviewed as part of the literature review and data gap analysis are provided in the following sections.

## C-1.1 Soil Data

Concentrations of Metals and Other Elements in Surface Soils of Flin Flon, Manitoba and Creighton, Saskatchewan, 2006. Manitoba Conservation. 2007. Report No. 2007-01.

<u>Objective</u>: To determine the concentration and distribution of metals and other elements in the surface soils of Flin Flon, Manitoba and Creighton, Saskatchewan.

<u>Summary</u>: Manitoba Conservation conducted a surface soil sampling program in August 2006 which involved the collection of soil from 93 sites in Flin Flon and 13 sites in Creighton. In addition, to characterize areas that are believed to be minimally impacted and non-impacted, samples were collected from Bakers Narrows Provincial Park and Cranberry Portage, respectively. Samples were collected from the top 2.5 cm of soil within publicly accessible lands such as boulevards, parks, playgrounds, school-yards, vacant lots and undeveloped areas.

The results of this study indicated that concentrations of the following twelve chemicals were found to be elevated relative to concentrations measured in the Cranberry Portage reference area:

- Antimony;
- Arsenic;
- Cadmium;
- Copper;
- Lead;
- Mercury;
- Molybdenum;
- Selenium;
- Silver:
- Sulphur;
- Thallium; and,
- Zinc.

In addition to the finding that concentrations of these compounds were elevated across much of the study area, they were also strongly inter-correlated and are known to be past or present constituents of the HBMS smelter emissions. When compared to the CCME soil quality guidelines and interim remediation criteria for soils under a residential or parkland scenario, concentrations of arsenic, cadmium, copper, lead, mercury, selenium, and thallium all exceeded their guidelines. Although concentrations of zinc exceeded the CCME guideline, this guideline is protective of environmental health and does not contain a human health component. Concentrations of antimony, molybdenum, silver and sulphur did not exceed their corresponding interim remediation criterion.



<u>Comments</u>: It is anticipated that the results of this report will form the basis of the Problem Formulation for the human health risk assessment (HHRA). Although other studies which involved the collection and analysis of soils will be considered, this report provides the most complete database and the most relevant sampling depths and locations to the HHRA. A potential area of significant uncertainty is the absence of soil samples taken from the front and backyards of residential properties. Although this study has effectively characterized concentrations in public areas, an HHRA will commonly assume that chronic exposure events, for children in particular, will occur at the home. Exposure to metals in soil *via* incidental ingestion and dermal contact, as well as inhalation of re-suspended dusts, is most accurately characterized using values measured from children's play areas on residential properties.

The chemical and Physical Characteristics of Heavy Metals in Humus and Till in the Vicinity of the Base Metal Smelter at Flin Flon, Manitoba, Canada. Henderson, P.J., McMartin, I., Hall, G.E., Percival, J.B., and Walker, D.A. 1998. Environmental Geology 34 (1).

<u>Objective</u>: To characterize smelter-related contamination through the analysis of metals in humus and till samples taken from varying distances from the HBMS complex.

<u>Summary</u>: Previous studies have indicated that emissions from the smelter have resulted in elevated tree mortality, reduced growth, soil erosion, and a reduction in species diversity in areas located up to several kilometers from the smelter (Hogan and Wotton, 1984). Studies analyzing metal content in bogs and fens found elevated concentrations at distances as far as 100 km south-southeast from the smelter (Zoltai, 1988). Other studies involving the analysis of rain and snow found that the distribution of contamination was chemical specific, with distances ranging from a 33 to 217 km radius from the smelter such that Zn>Pb>As>Cu (Franzin *et al.*, 1979). Analysis of chemical forms in previous studies have also indicated that 50 to 60% of zinc and 20 to 35% of copper in upper organic layers of forest floors were in bioavailable forms (Hogan and Wotton, 1984).

Humus and till were sampled from 23 sites. Till samples were collected from below the B soil horizon from exposed sections or from holes dug to bedrock or a maximum depth of 1 m. Humus samples were collected adjacent to or directly above the till sample. For the purposes of the current study, humus was defined as upper organic-rich portion of the soil horizon. This layer receives direct deposits of smelter-related emissions. Concentrations of metals in this layer decreased with increasing distance from the smelter. Zinc was found up to 94 times the concentration found in regional background samples at a distance of 10 km and reduced to 1.6 times regional background levels at a distance of 80 km. Concentrations of mercury reached a maximum of 500 times the regional background concentration at a distance of <5 km and reduced to 1.5 times at a distance of 40 km. Generally, concentrations in till were not directly related to distance from the smelter and were generally less variable than concentrations in humus.

Composition of till (>45 cm bgs) was generally a reflection of bedrock geology with modifications as a result of glacial erosion, transport, and deposition. The composition of humus was influenced to a greater extent by the interactions between geochemical, biogeochemical, and atmospheric processes.



Impact of a Base Metal Smelter on the Geochemistry of Soils of the Flin Flon Region, Manitoba and Saskatchewan. McMartin, I., Henderson, P.J., and E. Nielsen. 1999. Can. J. Earth Sci. 36: 141-160.

<u>Objective</u>: To estimate the influence of anthropogenic contamination on concentrations of six heavy metals (arsenic, cadmium, copper, mercury, lead, zinc) in humus and till in the Flin Flon area.

<u>Summary</u>: The current study used the results from a regional geochemical mapping project conducted by the Geological Survey of Canada and Manitoba Energy and Mines (Henderson, 1995; McMartin *et al.*, 1996) in Flin Flon, central Manitoba, and Saskatchewan. Humus and till were sampled at greater than 1,600 sites within a 200 km radius of the HBMS smelter in Flin Flon. Samples were taken at an average of spacing of 4 km, with a total of 1,817 samples of till and 1,639 samples of humus collected. Humus samples were collected directly over or immediately adjacent to the till sampling location. This study also characterized concentrations of metals representative of regional background levels by calculating the median concentrations near Snow Lake. This area is geologically similar to the Flin Flon area but is considered to be locates at a distance (<100 km) that is not influenced by emissions from the HBMS smelter.

Humus and till are influenced by atmospheric releases of gases and particulates from the smelter as well as dusts originating from tailings, exposed ore residue dumps, and ore and concentrate disturbed during transportation (Franzin, 1984). In areas not directly influenced by point source anthropogenic releases, metals that naturally occur in the environment, such as lead and mercury, tend to concentrate in humus as a result of long-term upward translocation by plant roots and accumulation through the decomposition of plant materials (Stevenson, 1994).

The results of the study indicate that the distance from the smelter in which concentrations returned to regional background concentrations varied for each metal but averaged 70 km for cadmium, 76 km for lead, 84 km for zinc, 85 km for mercury, 90 km for copper, and 104 km for arsenic. Although these results are similar to those found through the analysis of peat samples (Zoltai, 1988), they differ from results found through the analysis of bulk precipitation (Franzin *et al.*, 1979) in which a much greater area of impact was predicted (cadmium up to 284 km and zinc up to 264 km). Harrison and Klaverkamp (1990) predicted that copper, cadmium, and zinc were not transported at distances greater than 68 km to the northwest based on analysis of metals in sediments.

Although concentrations in humus are a reflection of mixing with the mineral matter and biogeochemical cycling (Steiness and Njastad, 1993), in the Flin Flon region, the primary factor is the contribution from the HBMS complex. Henderson *et al.* (1998) used a sequential extraction analysis to show that copper, cadmium, lead, and zinc are found in a highly leachable (labile) form in the soluble organic phase of humus (humic and fulvic complexes). In contrast, arsenic and mercury were found to be in less mobile nonlabile phases (humin and mineral matter).

While the concentrations of metals in humus in the Flin Flon area are primarily a reflection of the influence of the smelter, concentrations in till are more heavily influenced by the composition and nature of the bedrock and are modified by glacial erosion, transport, and deposition (McMartin *et al.*, 1996).

Overall, the study found that contamination of smelter-related metals is generally restricted to the organic surface horizon (humus) and that concentrations are poorly correlated with concentrations in the underlying till. However, in close proximity to the smelter (<10 km),



migration through the soil profile is significant and elevated concentrations are found to a minimum depth of 45 cm.

**Determining the Cutoff Between Background and Relative Base Metal Smelter Contamination Levels using Multifractal Methods.** Sim, B.L., Frederik, P., Agterberg, P., and Beaudry, C. 1999. Computers and Geosciences 25: 1023-1041.

<u>Objective</u>: To demonstrate the usefulness of a multifractal model to predict break points between background and anamolous environmental concentrations by using measured values of metals in humus measured in Flin Flon.

<u>Summary</u>: This paper uses data collected by McMartin and Henderson to test a computer model that uses a multifractal area-concentration approach to predict the potential limits of smelter-related contamination in humus. The predicted distances from the smelter at which concentrations return to background levels support previous findings (142, 104, and 105 km from the smelter for copper, zinc, and mercury, respectively).

Mercury Distribution in Humus and Surficial Sediments, Flin Flon, Manitoba, Canada. Henderson, P.J., and McMartin, I. 1995. Water, Air, and Soil Pollution 80: 1043-1046.

<u>Objective</u>: To evaluate the distribution of total mercury in humus and underlying till in the Flin Flon area.

<u>Summary</u>: As part of a regional surficial geological mapping project conducted by the Geological Survey of Canada, humus and surficial sediment samples were collected from the Flin Flon and Snow Lake area. Forests in this area are a mixed coniferous deciduous boreal community which includes jack pine, black spruce, white spruce, balsam fir, trembling aspen, and balsam poplar (Hogan and Wotton, 1984). Smelter-related metals have been found to elevated in forest soil (Hogan and Wooton, 1984) and peat (Zoltai, 1988), increasing with increased proximity to the smelter. The current study focused on concentrations of total mercury which is released from the smelter as fine particles.

Humus and till samples were collected during the summers of 1992 and 1993. Till samples were collected from directly below or immediately adjacent to the overlying humus sample at depths to a maximum of 1 m. Overall, concentrations of mercury in humus were higher than those measured in till, with median concentrations of 266 ppb and 50 ppb in humus and till, respectively. Concentrations in humus were as high as 250 times the estimated background concentration of 400 ppb, whereas concentrations in till were only as high as 7 times the background concentration (60 ppb). Concentrations in humus decreased rapidly with distance from the smelter and generally returned to background levels at a distance of 35 km. Concentrations in till were relatively constant regardless of distance. The organic content of humus did not appear to be a factor in mercury content in this layer. Given that organic content in humus was low in close proximity to the smelter, it is suggested that mercury concentrations are more directly linked to deposition from the smelter rather than incorporation from the surrounding soil and organic matter.



# Manitoba Conservation Blueberry Study. Manitoba Conservation. 2000. (Unpublished).

<u>Summary</u>: As part of a study in which concentrations of several metals were measured in blueberries collected from a number of locations in the Flin Flon area, as well as Cranberry Portage, soil concentrations from the sampling locations were also measured. A report is not available to discuss the sampling protocol or a summary of the results. Two spreadsheets were provided; one containing the data for the blueberry analysis and one containing the results of the soils analysis. Three soil samples were taken from each of 13 sites. Easting and northing coordinates are provided for each location. Samples were taken from depths ranging from 1.5 to 7 cm bgs. Descriptions of the sampling locations are provided in the table below.

Table C-	1 Description of Sampling Locations within the Blueberry Sampling Study
Station	Site Description
TQ0151	Blue-berry Site #1, 4.91 km ESE of HBM&S smelter via Hwy #10
TQ0152	Blue-berry Site #2, 8.6 km ESE of HBM&S smelter via Hwy #10
TQ0153	Blue-berry Site #3, 15.03 km ESE of HBM&S smelter, access via Little Spruce Lake Rd.
TQ0154	Blue-berry Site #4, 39.4 km ESE of HBM&S smelter at Cranberry Portage lagoon
TQ0155	Blue-berry Site #5, 5.27 km SSE of HBM&S smelter via road along Northwest Arm of Schist Lake
TQ0156	Blue-berry Site #6, 14.55 km SSE of HBM&S smelter via West Arm Mine road
TQ0157	Blue-berry Site #7, 2.51 km SSE of HBM&S smelter on golf course road
TQ0158	Blue-berry Site #8, 3.88 km NNE of HBM&S smelter near radio tower at Cliff Lake
TQ0159	Blue-berry Site #9, 2.70 km ESE of HBM&S smelter at original Hillside Cemetery
TQ0160	Blue-berry Site #10, 3.14 km NE of HBM&S smelter at trans tower near off of Hwy #10
TQ0161	Blue-berry Site #11, 1.95 km NNE of HBM&S smelter E side of railroad tracks
TQ0162	Blue-berry Site #12, 35.39 km SSE of HBM&S smelter in cutover along Athapap Rd.
TQ0163	Blue-berry Site #13, 155.43 km SSE of HBM&S off east side of Hwy #10 near Springwater Rec Area

The highest of the three concentrations measured for each site are presented in the table below.

Table C-2	2 Summary of Maximum Soil Concentrations Found at Each Sampling									
	Locat	ion (µg/g)								
Location	Arsenic	Cadmium	Copper	Lead	Mercury	Molybdenum	Thallium	Zinc		
TQ0151	180	50	2,040	1,030	6.48	<10	<10	10,100		
TQ0152	47	41	1,290	901	7.67	<10	<10	6,210		
TQ0153	6.3	7	205	151	0.91	<10	<10	1,300		
TQ0154	20	4	101	91	0.47	<10	<10	750		
TQ0155	88	67	1,610	1,220	14.9	<10	<10	12,900		
TQ0156	36	33	776	224	3.8	<10	<10	4,280		
TQ0157	27	99	4,240	1,130	40.6	<10	<10	21,000		
TQ0158	70	55	1,180	486	11.1	<10	<10	7,980		
TQ0159	120	69	2,780	1,310	28.8	<10	<10	9,510		
TQ0160	94	69	2,830	1,450	36.5	<10	<10	11,200		
TQ0161	210	125	5,060	2,500	44.3	<10	<10	24,700		
TQ0162	4.7	4	153	151	0.73	<10	<10	580		
TQ0163	<0.1	1	9	31	0.36	<10	<10	72		
Мах	210	125	5,060	2,500	44.3	<10	<10	24,700		



Metal Concentrations in Soils and Produce from Gardens in Flin Flon, Manitoba. 2002. Jones and Henderson. 2006.

<u>Objective</u>: To measure concentrations of metals in garden soils and home garden produce within the city of Flin Flon and to provide an assessment of the potential human health risks associated with the consumption of home garden produce.

<u>Summary</u>: Manitoba Conservation designed and completed a home garden sampling program in 2002 to address public concerns raised in response to discrepancies reported in the home garden surveys completed by Pip (1991) and HBMS (1994). Nine home gardens from the Flin Flon area, located at varying distances and directions from the HBMS complex, were selected to characterize the potential influence of smelter-related emissions. In addition, a garden located in the community of Cranberry Portage was selected to be representative of an area that is minimally impacted by smelter emissions. A garden in the town of The Pas was selected to represent a non-impacted control site.

<u>Comments</u>: In addition to home garden produce data, this report provides a significant database of concentrations of metals in soils on residential properties. Manitoba Conservation has provided detailed spreadsheets of all soil data collected as part of this study. Three replicate soil samples were collected from each of eleven garden plots. Samples were collected from a depth of 10 cm. The locations of the garden plots are described in the following table.

Table C-3	Table C-3 Location and Description of Home Garden Plots									
Location I.D.	Location	Distance from Smelter (km)	Direction							
TQ0164	Flin Flon	0.90	SE							
TQ0165	Flin Flon	1.71	SE							
TQ0166	Flin Flon	1.21	E							
TQ0167	Flin Flon	1.85	Е							
TQ0168	Flin Flon	1.91	SE							
TQ0169	Flin Flon	2.30	E							
TQ0170	Flin Flon	1.93	NE							
TQ0171	Flin Flon	2.37	NE							
TQ0172	Flin Flon	2.71	NE							
TQ0173	Cranberry Portage	38.23	SE							
TQ0174	The Pas	115.01	SE							

The highest of the three replicate concentrations for each garden plot are presented in the following table.

Table C	-4 Su	mmary o	of Maxim	um Soil	Conc	entratio	ns Fo	und at Ea	ich Ga	rden Plo	)t
	(µg	/g)									
Location	Antimony	Arsenic	Cadmium	Copper	Lead	Mercury	Moly	Selenium	Silver	Thallium	Zinc
TQ0164	<10	50.4	11	636	474	25.9	<4	6.3	1.1	0.3	3,120
TQ0165	<10	14.4	6.9	376	229	7.2	<4	2.8	1.7	0.2	1,690
TQ0166	<10	9.4	2.9	201	71	6.91	<4	2.1	0.3	0.1	675
TQ0167	<10	13.8	5.4	262	141	3.55	<4	1.7	0.6	0.3	1,640
TQ0168	<10	16.5	3.2	747	133	3.3	<4	1.8	1.8	0.3	1,340
TQ0169	<10	9.1	2.8	173	59	1.43	<4	1.3	0.5	0.2	743
TQ0170	<10	9.1	2.4	177	49	1.56	<4	1	0.3	0.3	1,040
TQ0171	<10	6.2	1.9	126	30	2.18	<4	0.9	0.5	0.3	741
TQ0172	<10	3.1	0.8	66	12	0.64	<4	0.4	0.1	0.2	306
TQ0173	<10	3	0.5	30	48	0.22	<4	0.3	0.1	<0.1	215
TQ0174	<10	5.3	0.3	14	8	0.04	<4	0.5	<0.1	0.1	56
Max	<10	50.4	11	747	474	25.9	<4	6.3	1.8	0.3	3,120



Although soil samples were collected from residential locations, given that they were taken 10 cm bgs, they are not likely appropriate to be used in the HHRA for direct contact pathways (*i.e.*, incidental ingestion, inhalation, and dermal contact).

# Manitoba Conservation Forest Sites Soil Data (1998/1999 and 2003). Manitoba

Conservation. 2003. (unpublished).

<u>Summary</u>: Manitoba Conservation has provided spreadsheets containing soil data for seven) forest sites in Flin Flon and a single control site. A total of 16 samples were taken at each of the seven locations at depths ranging from 0 to 15 cm bgs. The first round of sampling at these locations occurred during the summers of 1998 and 1999. These locations were re-sampled during the summer of 2003. The sample locations are described in the following table.

Table C-5	Location and Description of Forest Soil Sampling Locations									
Sample I.D.		Distance from Smelter (km)	Direction							
TQ0051		4.8	Southeast							
TQ0052		8.7	Southeast							
TQ0053		15.2	Southeast							
TQ0054		38.8	Southeast							
TQ0055		5.6	South							
TQ0056		14.9	South							
TQ0057		36.6	South							
TQ0058		67.4	Control							

The highest of the 16 samples for each forest sampling area are presented in the following tables for the 1998; 1999 and 2003 sampling periods. The highest measured concentrations were consistently found in the upper 0 to 6 cm within the organic layer of soil as found in Henderson and McMartin (1995) and McMartin *et al.* (1999).

Table C-	Table C-6 Summary of Maximum Soil Concentrations Found at Forest Sampling Sites in 1998: 1999 (ug/g)									
Location	Arsenic	Cadmium	Copper	Lead	Mercury	Moly	Selenium	Zinc		
TQ0051	141	49	3,010	1,740	16.5	<10	14.5	15,300		
TQ0052	91	40	1,400	984	4.35	<10	8.5	10,300		
TQ0053	36	10	351	340	2	<10	4.5	2,180		
TQ0054	34	8.9	270	234	0.94	<10	3.0	1,120		
TQ0055	210	85	1,760	1,140	15.5	<10	12.4	14,200		
TQ0056	98	22	539	629	2.8	<10	6.2	2,540		
TQ0057	16	19	134	153	1.18	<10	3.0	706		
TQ0058	<10	1.2	61	45	0.67	<10	1.1	326		
Мах	210	85	3,010	1,740	16.5	<10	14.5	15,300		

Table C-7	Summary of Maximum Soil Concentrations Found at Forest Sampling Site
	in 2003 (μg/g)

Location	Antimony	Arsenic	Cadmium	Copper	Lead	Mercury	Moly	Selenium	Silver	Thallium	Zinc
TQ0051	8.6	94.5	43.6	2,820	1,690	30.6	1.8	25.2	3.2	1.3	11,900
TQ0052	8.4	99.8	44.2	1,800	1,730	10.9	1.1	19.2	2.1	1.2	9,270
TQ0053	3.2	39.8	6.9	401	601	1.7	2.4	5.9	0.7	0.3	1,960
TQ0054	1.2	26.5	6.1	145	200	0.65	0.5	3.5	<0.1	0.5	774
TQ0055	7.3	101	31.7	1,700	1,280	21.3	1.6	22.2	2.3	0.9	9,160
TQ0056	4.1	37.5	20.3	596	469	2.01	0.8	5.5	1.0	0.4	2,200
TQ0057	1	18.4	5.8	104	129	0.7	9.8	2	0.2	0.1	435
TQ0058	<1	4.7	1.1	62	75.4	0.27	1.2	1.2	0.6	0.4	164
Max	8.6	101	44.2	2,820	1730	30.6	9.8	25.2	3.2	1.3	11,900



<u>Comments</u>: Given that humans are more likely to spend chronic exposure durations among residential, commercial, and parkland areas, concentrations in forest soils may not be relevant to the HHRA. However, should it be required that concentrations in wild game or local berries or other edible plants and fruits be predicted based on environmental concentrations, these data may represent the most appropriate basis for these calculations.

# C-1.2 Air Data

Flin Flon Area Quarterly Air Quality Reports. Manitoba Conservation- Air Quality Section.

<u>Objective</u>: Manitoba Conservation issues reports on a quarterly basis summarizing air quality in the Flin Flon area as measured by Manitoba Conservation and HBMS.

<u>Summary</u>: Outdoor ambient air is continuously monitored for sulphur dioxide (SO<sub>2</sub>) and particulate matter, including associated heavy metals. Monitors are located at four sampling locations in Flin Flon and Creighton:

- Provincial Building;
  - Operated by Manitoba Conservation;
- Ruth Betts School;
  - Operated by HBMS;
- Sewage Plant;
  - Operated by HBMS;
  - Creighton School; and,
    - Operated by HBMS.

The quarterly reports indicate the frequency of exceedances of selected air quality criteria.

Table C-8 Annual Average Metal Concentrations Associated with PM <sub>10</sub> in Ambient							
	(µg/m <sup>3</sup> )						
Location	Lead	Copper	Cadmium	Zinc	Arsenic		
Provincial Build	ing		·		•		
2002	-	-	-	-	-		
2003	-	-	-	-	-		
2004	-	-	-	-	-		
2005	-	-	-	-	-		
2006	-	-	-	-	-		
Ruth Betts Scho	ol						
2002	0.15	0.35	0.02	0.56	0.02		
2003	0.16	0.33	0.02	0.78	0.04		
2004	0.03	0.13	0.00	0.76	0.01		
2005	0.07	0.18	0.01	0.37	0.02		
2006	0.06	0.13	0.02	0.13	0.02		
Sewage Plant							
2002	0.12	0.23	0.02	0.31	0.03		
2003	-	-	-	-	-		
2004	-	-	-	-	-		
2005	-	-	-	-	-		
2006	-	-	-	-	-		
Creighton Schoo	ol <sup>a</sup>						
2002	-	-	-	-	-		
2003	0.42	0.15	0.04	0.24	0.01		
2004	0.42	0.13	0.04	0.23	0.01		
2005	0.42	0.13	0.06	0.36	0.01		



Table C-8	Annual Average Metal Concentrations Associated with $PM_{10}$ in Ambient Air ( $\mu$ g/m <sup>3</sup> )					
Location	Lead	Copper	Cadmium	Zinc	Arsenic	
2006	0.17	0.05	0.01	0.09	0.01	

Measurements are from the dichotomous air sampler.

Table C-9	Annual Av (µg/m <sup>3</sup> )	verage Metal	Concentration	s Associated	d with TSP in .	Ambient Air
Location	Lead	Copper	Cadmium	Zinc	Arsenic	Mercury
Provincial Bui	lding			•		
2002	0.276	0.979	0.045	2.280	0.043	-
2003	0.225	1.042	0.032	1.820	0.054	-
2004	0.109	0.980	0.015	2.457	0.038	-
2005	0.175	0.894	0.022	1.646	0.043	-
2006	0.144	0.940	0.041	2.245	0.049	-
2007 <sup>a</sup>	0.263	1.369	0.054	1.343	0.081	-
Ruth Betts Sc	hool					
2002	0.150	0.688	0.019	0.851	0.037	0.0006
2003	0.136	0.799	0.018	1.193	0.037	0.0008
2004	0.040	0.576	0.006	0.898	0.016	0.0008
2005	0.089	0.764	0.014	0.603	0.023	0.0006
2006	0.059	0.742	0.020	0.287	0.024	0.0005
2007 <sup>a</sup>	0.086	0.874	0.025	0.593	0.044	0.0003
Sewage Plant						
2002	0.122	0.639	0.023	0.602	0.031	0.0004
2003	-	-	-	-	-	0.0004
2004	-	-	-	-	-	-
2005	-	-	-	-	-	-
2006	-	-	-	-	-	-
2007 <sup>a</sup>	-	-	-	-	-	-
Creighton Sch	lool					
2002*	0.167	0.560	0.005	0.773	0.151	-
2003*	0.036	0.647	0.004	0.427	0.009	0.0003
2004*	0.028	0.495	0.003	0.470	0.006	0.0004
2005*	0.039	0.417	0.007	0.334	0.011	0.0004
2006	0.024	0.446	0.005	0.143	0.008	0.0001
2007 <sup>a</sup>	0.027	0.415	0.005	0.076	0.009	0.0001

\* Note From January 1998 to mid- 2005, samples from Ruth Betts, Sewage Plant, and Creighton School were only analyzed when wind direction was from the facility.

<sup>a</sup> Concentrations are the average for data sampled from January 1<sup>st</sup> to May 31<sup>st</sup> 2007.

#### Comments on Data:

Concentrations of metals associated with the  $PM_{10}$  component are higher than those associated with TSP for the Creighton School. This is a result of the use of the dichotomous air sampler used to collect the  $PM_{10}$  data. In 2003 when the dichotomous air sampler replaced the previous air sampler, the concentrations of metals associated with  $PM_{10}$  increased significantly. This increase is a result of elevated detection limits that are used to analyze for metals in the small samples collected by the dichotomous sampler. According to HBMS, the dichotomous sampler uses an 8 cm filter that retains less particulates than the previous sampler which used a 10 cm filter.

Several metals that were identified as being elevated in soils and that have been associated with emissions from the smelter are not part of the air analysis. This includes antimony, molybdenum, selenium, silver, and thallium.



# C-1.3 Home Garden Data

**Metal Concentrations in Soils and Produce from Gardens in Flin Flon, Manitoba, 2002.** Jones, G., and V. Henderson. 2006. Habitat Management and Ecosystem Monitoring Section, Wildlife and Ecosystem Branch, Manitoba Conservation. Winnipeg, M.B. Manitoba Conservation Report No. 2006-01. pp 81.

<u>Objective</u>: To measure concentrations of metals in garden soils and home garden produce within the city of Flin Flon and to provide an assessment of the potential human health risks associated with the consumption of home garden produce.

<u>Summary</u>: Manitoba Conservation designed and completed a home garden sampling program in 2002 to address public concerns raised in response to discrepancies reported in the home garden surveys completed by Pip (1991) and HBMS (1994). Nine home gardens from the Flin Flon area, located at varying distances and directions from the HBMS complex, were selected to characterize the potential influence of smelter-related emissions. In addition, a garden located in the community of Cranberry Portage was selected to be representative of an area that is minimally impacted by smelter emissions. A garden in the town of The Pas was selected to represent a non-impacted control site.

Manitoba Conservation established 2.0x2.5 m plots within each garden and planted potatoes, tomatoes, beans, lettuce, and carrots in each plot in June, 2002. Plots were weeded and watered as required during the months of June and July. Potatoes, lettuce, beans, and carrots were harvested in August, and tomatoes were harvested in September. Three replicate samples of each vegetable were collected from each plot. Composite samples were collected for beans, carrots, and lettuce. Samples were restricted to the edible portion of each vegetable. To determine what fraction of the total concentration of metals could be attributed to particulates on the surface of the vegetable relative to that within the tissues, replicate samples for lettuce, tomato, and bean were divided and one half was washed in tap water while the other half was left unwashed. Three replicate soil samples were collected from each plot during the August vegetable sampling.

Analysis of soil samples indicated that mean concentrations of arsenic, cadmium, copper, lead, mercury, zinc, selenium, chromium, vanadium, and titanium were significantly higher in Flin Flon gardens than in the control site garden in The Pas. Concentrations of arsenic, cadmium, copper, mercury, selenium, and zinc were all highly correlated. Concentrations of arsenic, cadmium, copper, mercury, selenium, and silver in Cranberry Portage did not differ significantly from concentrations in The Pas, indicating that smelter emissions may not have a significant influence on conditions in Cranberry Portage.

Concentrations of arsenic, cadmium, copper, lead, mercury, selenium, and zinc in vegetables from Flin Flon were generally higher than those from The Pas. Concentrations in lettuce were typically higher than in other vegetables, followed by carrots, potatoes, beans, and tomatoes. Concentrations of certain metals (*e.g.*, cadmium and mercury) in vegetables were highly correlated with concentrations in soil, indicating that metals were absorbed from soil. A comparison between concentrations in washed and unwashed samples of lettuce indicated that atmospheric deposition was likely a contributing factor.

Manitoba Conservation used tolerable daily intake guidelines (TDIs) and typically daily intake values to determine the amount of home garden vegetables that would need to be consumed to exceed the TDI for several age/weight classes. This assessment indicated that in most cases,



the amount of vegetables that would need to be consumed to exceed the TDI was significantly higher than the typical daily intake values for these vegetables.

Overall, the study concluded that although concentrations of certain metals were elevated in vegetables grown in Flin Flon gardens, the concentrations and anticipated consumption rates are not anticipated to result in human health concerns for individuals consuming home garden produce.

Heavy Metals in Flin Flon Area Gardens. Hudson Bay Mining and Smelting. 1994a.

<u>Objective</u>: To measure concentrations of smelter-related metals in soils and home garden produce in Flin Flon and Creighton and compare concentrations in home garden produce to concentrations in produce from a local grocery store.

<u>Summary</u>: In the fall of 1994, HBMS collected soil and vegetable samples from seven gardens in Flin Flon and one in Creighton. Soil samples were a composite of samples taken from multiple locations around each garden within the top 10 cm. Types of vegetables collected were limited to those available in individual gardens but generally included those representative of root, fruiting, and leafy vegetables. In addition, vegetable samples were taken from a local grocery store and submitted for analysis to allow for a comparison to the results of the home garden survey.

HBMS found that concentrations of metals in soil and vegetables decreased with distance from the complex and that concentrations in vegetables were positively related to concentrations in soil. Concentrations in leafy vegetables, such as lettuce, cabbage, chard, and beet tops were significantly higher than those observed in other types of vegetables.

When compared to concentrations in vegetables collected from the local grocery store, mean concentrations in carrots and tomatoes from home gardens were similar. However, lettuce from home gardens had concentrations of all metals except lead that were 50 to 75% higher than lettuce from the local grocery store. Concentrations of lead in lettuce from home gardens was approximately 70% lower than lettuce from the local grocery store.

This report provides concentrations of arsenic, copper, cadmium, mercury, lead, and zinc on a dry weight basis. Data are summarized for soil, beets, beet tops, carrots, tomatoes, cabbage, lettuce, and chard. A comparison is also provided for concentrations of cadmium, copper, and lead in soil and vegetables from the current study and those reported by Pip (1991).

Cadmium, Copper, and Lead in Soils and Garden Produce near a Metal Smelter at Flin Flon, Manitoba. Pip, E. 1991. Bull. Environ. Contamin. Toxicol. (1991) 46: 790-796.

<u>Objective</u>: To examine concentrations of cadmium, copper, and lead in soils and garden produce near the Flin Flon smelter.

<u>Summary</u>: Wind in the Flin Flon area is predominately from the northwest to the northeast directions and has an average annual velocity of 11.1 km/hr. Approximately 34% of the time, the wind direction blows from the smelter towards the city of Flin Flon (Manfreda and Sabesky, 1987). For the current study, soil and vegetable samples were collected from home gardens at the end of the 1989 growing season at 12 locations that raged in distance from 0.29 to 12.8 km northeast to southwest of the HBMS complex. Vegetable samples were washed with Flin Flon drinking water prior to analysis. Soil samples were collected from the top 10 cm of garden soil.



Concentrations of cadmium, copper, and lead all decreased significantly with distance from the smelter. A strong intercorrelation was found for all metals in soil. A significant level of variation was noted for concentrations of metals in produce. When concentrations in all produce were pooled (untransformed data), a significant inverse relationship was noted with distance from the smelter (log transformed data). Pooled produce concentrations were also significantly correlated with concentrations in soil. Metal concentrations in soil were consistently higher than concentrations in produce, with the certain exceptions for leafy tissues. Leafy tissues had significantly higher concentrations than fruits and below ground tissues. However, concentrations in leafy tissues were not significantly correlated with concentrations in soil. This was attributed largely to aerial deposition and the large surface area to volume ratio of leafy tissues. Previous studies have indicated that lead is not readily translocated from leaves to other plant tissues (Carlson *et al.*, 1976). Similarly, studies by Wotton (1979); McEachern and Phillips (1983) found that blueberries in the Flin Flon area contained lower concentrations of metals in fruits relative to concentrations in stems, leaves, and roots.

# C-1.4 Drinking Water Data

#### Hudson Bay Mining and Smelting Drinking Water Data from the Vocational Centre.

<u>Summary</u>: HBMS tests drinking water samples from the Vocational Centre in Flin Flon on a monthly basis. Samples are tested for arsenic, cadmium, calcium, copper, iron, lead, magnesium, manganese, potassium, sodium, and zinc. Results are available for samples collected from 1995 to 2007. HBMS bottles this water for use within its facility for drinking purposes. However, an additional filter is used prior to the collection and analysis of drinking water from this location; therefore, it is not representative of water distributed to the remainder of the community.

The results of this sampling program should not be used in the human health risk assessment to assess exposure of the general population to metals through the consumption of drinking water.

#### Manitoba Conservation Drinking Water Data

<u>Summary</u>: Manitoba Conservation has provided drinking water data for most years from 1982 to 2006. One sample per year taken at varying months was analyzed for arsenic, cadmium, copper, lead, selenium, and zinc. Although historically samples were collected from both a treated tap at the water treatment plant and from the distribution system somewhere in the community, more recent samples 2004 to 2006 are only available for the treated tap at the treatment plant. Concentrations of metals from the treated tap for 2004 to 2006 are summarized in the following table.

Table C-10	Summary of Recent Drinking Water Data for Samples Taken from a Treated					
	Tap at the Fill	I FION Water	Treatment P	ant (µg/L)		
Date	Arsenic	Cadmium	Copper	Lead	Selenium	Zinc
September 2004	1.8	0.65	15	0.6	<0.2	100
November 2005	2.5	0.61	45	1.5	<0.2	86
June 2006	2.3	0.92	69	3.2	<0.2	85

## Additional Drinking Water Data for 2000- Source Unknown

<u>Summary</u>: A spreadsheet which includes concentrations of a number of metals as well as general physical and chemical parameters in raw and treated water for Flin Flon, station number



WD0069.00, is available for September 2000 (source unknown but likely Manitoba Conservation). A summary of the relevant data are provided in the following table.

Table C-11	Concentrations of Metals in Treated Drinking Water for Flin Flin from 2000 (µg/L total metals)					
Chemical		Treated Drinking Water				
Antimony		1				
Arsenic		5.7				
Cadmium		0.3				
Copper		23				
Lead		0.8				
Molybdenum		0.2				
Selenium		<2				
Silver		<0.4				
Zinc		100				

Given that these data are from 2000, it is not likely appropriate for use in the HHRA unless there are no other relevant sources of data for certain metals.

#### Additional Drinking Water Data for 2001 to 2006- Source Unknown.

<u>Summary</u>: A spreadsheet containing concentrations of a number of metals as well as general physical and chemical parameters for raw and treated water in Flin Flon tested by CANTEST Ltd. (community code 69.00) (source unknown but likely Manitoba Conservation). A summary of the relevant data are provided in the following table.

Table C-12	Concentrations of Metals in Treated Drinking Water for Flin Flin from 2002 to 2006 ( $\mu$ g/L total metals)						
Chemical	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006		
Antimony	0.7	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.5		
Arsenic	1.9	2.0	1.8	2.5	2.3		
Cadmium	0.68	0.61	0.65	0.61	0.92		
Copper	21	21	48	45	69		
Lead	0.7	0.3	0.6	1.5	3.2		
Molybdenum	<0.1	<0.1	<0.1	<0.1	<0.1		
Selenium	<0.2	<0.2	<0.2	<0.2	<0.2		
Silver	<0.02	<0.02	< 0.05	<0.05	<0.05		
Thallium	< 0.02	<0.02	<0.02	<0.02	<0.02		
Zinc	140	95	110	86	85		

**Creighton Distribution System Water Data (2005 and 2006).** Saskatchewan Environment, Environmental Protection Branch Provided by George Bihun, Environmental Officer. Available online: <u>http://www.saskh20.ca/mydrinkingwaterdata.asp</u>

<u>Summary</u>: Saskatchewan Environment provided a spreadsheet with various water chemistry data. Concentrations of certain metals are provided for the Creighton Distribution System. The most recent years for which these data are provided are 2005 and 2006. These data are summarized in the following table.

Table C-13	Concentrations of Metals Measured in the Creighton Distribution System in 2005 and 2006 (µg/L total)					
Chemical		February 2005	June 2006			
Arsenic		2.2	1.4			
Cadmium		<0.5	0.4			
Copper		13	3			



Table C-13	Concentrations in 2005 and 200	of Metals Measured in the Crei 6 (µg/L total)	ighton Distribution System
Chemical		February 2005	June 2006

Chemical	February 2005	June 2006
Lead	<0.1	<0.1
Mercury	-	<0.05
Selenium	0.2	0.1
Zinc	110	46

# C-1.5 Fish and Sediment Data

**Metal Concentrations in Fish and Sediment from Lakes near Flin Flon, Manitoba.** Harrison, S.E., Dutton, M.D., Hunt, R.V., Klaverkamp, J.F., Lutz, A., Macdonald, W.A., Majewski, H.S., and Wesson, L.J. 1989. Canadian Data Report of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences No. 747. Department of Fisheries and Oceans, Winnipeg, Manitoba.

<u>Objective</u>: To determine levels of metal contamination in white sucker and northern pike in lakes within the area of deposition of the Smelter.

<u>Summary</u>: This study was conducted in 1982 and involved a survey on lakes that were considered to be within the deposition zone of the smelter. This predicted zone of deposition was based on estimates provided in a previous study (Franzin *et al.*, 1979). Liver and skeletal muscle from white sucker (*Catostomus commersoni*) and northern pike (*Esox lucius*) were analyzed for arsenic, copper, cadmium, mercury, lead, selenium, and zinc. Thirteen lakes were sampled. Five lakes were from within an 8 km radius of the smelter (Flin Flon lakes); four lakes from 23 to 43 km east of the smelter (Manitoba lakes), and four lakes from 68 to 84 km northwest of the smelter (Saskatchewan lakes). Lake water from which fish were collected were analyzed for ionic composition. The survey was intended to evaluate the impact of a number of factors on concentrations in fish tissue including: lake water chemistry, distance from smelter, direction of prevailing winds, as well as species, sex, and age of fish. The potential impact of the installation of the taller stack in 1974 was also considered. Sediment core samples were taken from the sampled lakes in 1985 to assess the metal loadings and the impact of emission control measures over time.

<u>Comments</u>: Raw data are provided within this report however there is no interpretation or discussion of the data. The results of this study are discussed in Harrison and Klaverkamp (1990). This study did not measure metals in surface water; therefore, uptake factors cannot be derived. Sediment profiles (concentrations in  $\mu g/g$ ) are available for copper, cadmium, mercury, selenium, and zinc from 0 to 25 cm. Mean sediment concentrations are available for each chemical for each lake. Mean concentrations are also provided for concentrations of metals in liver and muscle samples.

<u>Other Relevant Information</u>: Up until 1974, the base-metal smelter released emissions through two stacks measuring 53 and 69 metres in height. In 1974, a larger stack (250 m) was built to replace one of these shorter stacks. Emission controls installed in 1982 resulted in a reduction in particulate emissions by 85% (Fraser, 1983). Numerous studies have indicated that elevated concentrations of metals occur in water, sediment, and macrophytes sampled from lakes within the Flin Flon area (Van Loon and Beamish, 1977; Jackson, 1978; McFarlane and Franzin, 1978; McFarlane *et al.*, 1979; Franzin and McFarlane, 1980; 1981).



Metal Contamination in Liver and Muscle of Northern Pike (*Esox lucius*) and White Sucker (*Catostomus commersoni*) and in Sediments from Lakes near the Smelter at Flin Flon, Manitoba. Harrison, S. E., and Klaverkamp, J.F. 1990. Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry. Vol. 9, pp.941-956.

<u>Objective</u>: To determine if metal concentrations in fish sampled from lakes surrounding the smelter can be predicted based on metal concentrations in sediments or from limnological variables. In addition, metal concentrations in sediment cores were used to evaluate the estimate of the area significantly impacted by the deposition of emissions from the smelter.

<u>Summary</u>: This paper was based on the results of the sampling data provided by Harrison *et al.* (1989) in which 13 lakes, located at distances of 4.5 to 84 km from the smelter, were surveyed. Liver and muscle samples were taken from northern pike and white sucker in 1982 and were analyzed for arsenic, copper, cadmium, mercury, selenium, lead, and zinc. Sediment cores were also collected and analyzed for copper, cadmium, mercury, selenium, and zinc in 1985 (three years after significant reductions in smelter emissions). Surface water samples were not taken because metal contamination within aquatic ecosystems is generally more accurately reflected in sediment composition. It was believed that measurements of metals in sediments would be a better predictor of contamination in biological tissues than surface water would be.

Five lakes were from within an 8 km radius of the smelter (Flin Flon lakes); four lakes from 23 to 43 km east of the smelter (Manitoba lakes), and four lakes from 68 to 84 km northwest of the smelter (Saskatchewan lakes). These lakes were chosen to allow for a comparison of highly contaminated lakes (Flin Flon lakes), moderately contaminated lakes (Manitoba lakes), and slightly contaminated lakes (Saskatchewan lakes). Since winds are predominately from the northwest in Flin Flon, the Saskatchewan lakes were considered to be upwind, whereas the Manitoba lakes were downwind of the smelter. Concentrations of metals in within the top 2 cm of sediments were highest in the Flin Flon lakes, followed by the Manitoba lakes, and the Saskatchewan lakes. The average concentrations of metals in each lake, based on four cores taken from each lake, are summarized in Table C-14.

Table C-14	Summary of Mean Concentrations of Metals within the Top 2 cm of							
	Sediments	(µg/g dw)				-		
Group	Lake	Distance (km)	Zinc	Copper	Cadmium	Mercury	Selenium	
	Hamell	4.5	8,408	2,775	56	3.27	11.1	
	Douglas	5	12,625	1,900	60	3.77	12.6	
Flin Flon	Phantom	5.4	6,988	1,385	36	9.22	4.5	
	Cliff	5.6	5,950	1,278	21	6.39	4.0	
	Meridian	7.6	2,858	568	15	2.69	3.4	
	Cleaver	23	1,238	198	7	1.30	2.5	
Manitoba	Naosap Mud	27	282	49	2	0.10	1.4	
	Kotyk	30	507	76	3	0.35	2.4	
	Nekik	43	170	34	<1	0.09	1.0	
	1	68	118	44	<1	0.11	0.9	
Saskatchewan	2	74	175	41	<1	0.14	1.3	
	3	83	46	13	<1	0.03	0.2	
	4	84	142	57	<1	0.22	0.9	

Based on the depth profiles of metal concentrations in sediments, there is evidence to indicate that elevated concentrations in surface sediments can be attributed to smelter emissions. Assuming a vertical sedimentation rate of 1.2 mm per year (Johnson, 1987), the increased metal concentrations observed at depths of 8 to 10 cm correspond to the start of the smelting



operations in 1930. Given that these lakes do not receive liquid effluent from the smelter and that they are over 400 km away from any major industrial complexes, there are no other significant sources of metals other than the deposition of smelter emissions.

The results of the sediment sampling indicate that the area receiving significant deposition of metals is likely much smaller than originally estimated by Franzin *et al.* (1979). Concentrations of metals in surface sediments of Saskatchewan lakes (68 to 84 km from the smelter) were equal to or less than lakes located in Ontario removed from significant anthropogenic sources. Based on the ratio of surface sediment to background concentrations of metals in sediments, it appears that the limit of deposition to the east was approximately 43 km as indicated by analysis of sediments in Nekik Lake. A study completed by Zoltai (1988) found that elevated levels of metals in peat occurred in an elliptical pattern surrounding the smelter stretching to the southeast up to a distance of 110 km.

Generally, concentrations of most metals were found to be highest in the liver of fish from Flin Flon lakes. While concentrations of metals such as cadmium, copper, selenium, and zinc were higher in the liver of fish from Flin Flon, relative to Saskatchewan, the opposite was true for mercury. Concentrations of mercury in the liver of both northern pike and white sucker were significantly higher in Saskatchewan lakes than in Flin Flon lakes. A similar pattern was observed in Sudbury, where concentrations of mercury in crayfish and perch were lower with increased proximity to the smelter. This was attributed to two factors. First, selenium has been reported to inhibit the accumulation of mercury by fish, therefore, increased concentrations of selenium in lakes closest to the smelter can have a significant impact on mercury accumulation. Secondly, Methylmercury represents the largest component of total mercury within the tissues of fish. It has been reported that elevated concentrations of copper, cadmium, and zinc in sediments reduces the methylation of mercury (Jackson, 1984). This is supported by the current study in which the highest concentrations of mercury in fish were associated with the lowest concentrations of copper, cadmium, selenium, and zinc in sediments.

Concentrations of metals in muscle tissue were not consistently higher in fish sampled from the Flin Flon lakes. Although concentrations of selenium were significantly higher in the muscle tissue of both pike and sucker in Flin Flon lakes, concentrations of mercury and copper were significantly higher in Saskatchewan lakes than in Flin Flon lakes. Concentrations of zinc in the muscle of white sucker were significantly higher in Flin Flon lakes relative to Saskatchewan lakes. Concentrations of cadmium in muscle tissue were below detection in all lakes with the exception of northern pike from Cliff lake. Concentrations of arsenic and lead were almost all below detection limits (Table C-15). Concentrations of lead and arsenic were below detection limits (<0.02 and <0.05  $\mu$ g/g, respectively) in almost all lakes. Detectable concentrations of arsenic were generally only found in lakes closest to the smelter. Concentrations of metals in the muscle of northern pike and the liver of white sucker were not significantly correlated with concentrations in sediments. However, concentrations of selenium in the liver of northern pike were positively correlated with selenium in sediment.

Table C-15 N V	Mean Concentrations of Metals in the Muscle Tissue of Northern Pike and White Sucker (μg/g w.w)						
Group	Species	Zinc	Copper	Cadmium	Mercury	Selenium	
Flin Flon	Northern Pike	5.6	0.16	<0.01	0.09	0.88	
	White Sucker	5.5	0.22	<0.01	0.02	1.05	
Manitaba	Northern Pike	5.1	0.12	<0.01	0.22	0.20	
IVIAIIIIODA	White Sucker	3.0	0.25	<0.01	0.03	0.22	
Saakatahawan	Northern Pike	5.7	0.22	<0.01	0.47	0.29	
Saskalchewan	White Sucker	3.5	0.34	<0.01	0.06	0.28	



Compared to concentrations of metals measured in fish in a 1976 survey, concentrations in fish measured in 1982 were lower (Table C-16).

Table C-16	Concentration White Sucker	Concentrations of Metals (μg/g w.w) in the Liver of Northern Pike and White Sucker from Hamell and Cliff Lakes in 1976 and 1982					
		Hamell Lake			Cliff Lake		
	Cadmium	Copper	Mercury	Cadmium	Copper	Mercury	
Northern Pike	·			•		· -	
1976	1.3	45	0.11	1.6	22	0.15	
1982	0.79	19.5	0.03	1.03	11.9	0.04	
White Sucker							
1976	1.1			2.7			
1982	0.51			0.48			

<u>Conclusions</u>: The results of the study indicate that concentrations of metals found in fish from the area surrounding the smelter were similar to concentrations observed in fish from remote lakes from the Precambrian shield of Ontario, which have not been impacted by anthropogenic sources. Concentrations in fish tissues were generally not directly proportional to concentrations in sediments. Results were generally similar to those observed in Sudbury.

<u>Other Relevant Information</u>: McFarlane and Franzin (1980) measured concentrations of cadmium, copper and mercury in the liver of northern pike and white sucker taken from five lakes within 20 km of the smelter in Flin Flon in 1976. The results of this study indicated that there was no significant relationship between concentrations of metals in liver and concentrations in sediments, metal deposition to lakes, or any other environmental variables.

**Ross-Schist Lake Limnological Survey 1994 Final Report.** Hudson's Bay Mining and Smelting Environment Department (HBMS, 1994b).

<u>Objective</u>: To measure physical, chemical and biological conditions within the Ross-Schist Lake system.

<u>Summary</u>: Ross Lake receives water from Flin Flon Creek and surface runoff from the surrounding area. Water drains from Ross Lake to the northwest arm of Schist Lake *via* Ross Creek. Schist Lake is a central basin composed of four elongated arms. Water from Schist Lake drains to Lake Athapapuskow *via* Schist Creek. In addition to chemical analysis of metals in sediments, surface water, and fish tissue, physical parameters such as secchi depth, temperature, dissolved oxygen, conductivity and pH were measured. The mean pH of Ross and Schist Lakes were 7.79 and 8.42, respectively.

Sediment samples were collected using an Ekkman Box Corer to collect the top 5 cm. Manitoba conservation does not provide sediment quality criteria.



Table C-17 Sediment Chemistry Data for Ross Lake (µg/g)							
Chemical		# Samples	Maximum	Mean <sup>a</sup>			
Copper		9	20,300	11,231			
Zinc		9	64,700	43,023			
Iron (%)		9	5.7	4.36			
Cadmium		9	769	364			
Lead		9	385	273			
Nickel		9	50.9	40			
Mercury		9	179	35			
Arsenic		9	316	201			
Manganese		9	415.4	368			

Mean values reported do not appear to be correct. Values presented were recalculated based on raw data presented in the report.

Table C-18	Table C-18    Sediment Chemistry Data for Schist Lake (µg/g)									
Chemical		# Samples	Maximum	Mean <sup>a</sup>						
Copper		31	11,270	NA						
Zinc		31	91,100	NA						
Iron (%)		31	9	NA						
Cadmium		31	480.6	NA						
Lead		31	235	NA						
Nickel		31	52.6	NA						
Mercury		31	12	NA						
Arsenic		31	596	NA						
Manganese		31	3,540	NA						

Mean values reported do not appear to be correct. Values presented were recalculated based on raw data presented in the report.

Fish samples were collected in July/August, 1994 and in October, 1994 using gill nets. Individual specimens were analyzed for metals in muscle tissue and liver tissue when sufficient tissue was available. Homogenizing of samples occurred when necessary. A total of 68 specimens were captured. Concentrations in fish from the northwest arm of Schist Lake did not exceed the Industry Services Branch of Manitoba Guidelines (1992). \*Note, the report does not specify if concentrations are weight or dry weight.

TableC-1	TableC-19      Concentrations of Metals in the Tissues of Fish from Schist Lake Sampled									
	in A	ugust 1994 (	µg/g)							
Species	Tissue	Parameter	Cu	Zn	Fe	Pb	Cd	Ni	Hg	As
Northern Pike (n=5)										
	Mussla	Mean	1.0	8.5	7.5	0.3	<0.1	1.0	0.047	0.046
	Muscle	Max	2.7	12.1	17.8	0.5	<0.1	3.6	0.078	0.098
	Liver	Mean	22.1	39.6	83.9	<0.3	<0.1	<0.2	0.056	0.029
	Liver	Max	28.9	51.2	135.4	<0.3	<0.1	<0.2	0.093	0.068
Walleye (n=	1)									
	Muscle	Mean	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
		Max	0.6	6.0	6.8	<0.3	<0.1	0.5	0.064	0.065
	1.5	Mean	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
	Liver	Max	7.4	21.1	90.3	<0.3	0.5	<0.2	0.04	0.11
Cisco ( mus	cle n=12, li	ver n=6)								
	Mussla	Mean	0.8	9.7	7.5	<0.3	<0.1	0.2	0.031	0.04
	wuscie	Max	1.1	23.9	10.8	<0.3	<0.1	0.4	0.078	0.08
	Liver	Mean	6.9	18	98.8	<0.3	0.2	<0.2	0.148	0.140
	Liver	Max	12.6	34.2	151.3	< 0.3	0.3	<0.2	0.690	0.194
Lake Whitef	ish (muscle	n=2, liver n=1)								
	Mussla	Mean	0.5	6.1	4.5	0.4	<0.1	<0.2	0.026	0.042
	wuscie	Max	0.5	6.2	4.7	0.4	<0.1	<0.2	0.026	0.063
	Liver	Mean	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
	Liver	Max	7.1	22.1	80.4	<0.3	0.4	<0.2	0.330	0.119



Table C-2	20 Con	centrations o	of Metal	s in the	Tissues	s of Fisł	n from S	Schist L	ake Sar	npled
	in O	ctober 1994 (	(µg/g)							-
Species	Tissue	Parameter	Cu	Zn	Fe	Pb	Cd	Ni	Hg	As
Northern Pil	Northern Pike (n=19)									
	Mussla	Mean	0.8	5.9	5.2	0.3	0.1	0.2	0.028	0.020
	wuscie	Max	1.3	8.6	7.7	0.5	0.3	0.3	0.074	0.028
	Liver	Mean	10	38.5	29	<0.3	0.1	0.2	0.018	0.019
	Liver	Max	20.2	59	71.1	<0.3	0.6	0.5	0.028	0.035
White Sucke	White Sucker (muscle n=4, liver n=2)									
	Mussla	Mean	0.7	4.9	4.5	0.3	0.2	<0.2	0.011	0.025
	IVIUSCIE	Max	0.8	5.7	5.0	0.4	0.2	<0.2	0.015	0.039
	Liver	Mean	7.9	32.7	33	0.5	0.3	0.3	0.034	0.053
	Livei	Max	9.4	34.1	37.3	0.7	0.3	0.3	0.037	0.067
Cisco (muso	cle n=21, liv	/er n=10)								
	Muselo	Mean	0.5	5.4	5.5	0.3	0.2	0.2	0.012	0.031
	wuscie	Max	0.7	7.2	8.0	0.4	0.4	0.3	0.02	0.045
	Livor	Mean	4	21.7	130.1	0.4	0.3	0.2	0.018	0.068
	Livei	Max	15.7	44.5	384.4	1.0	0.7	0.3	0.020	0.094
Lake Whitef	ish (muscle	e n=4, liver n=2)								
	Muselo	Mean	0.5	5.4	4.4	0.3	0.1	0.2	0.011	0.029
	wuscie	Max	0.6	6.0	5.9	0.4	0.2	0.3	0.015	0.040
	Livor	Mean	5.9	27.3	38.5	0.5	0.6	0.4	0.056	0.044
	Liver	Max	6.4	28	41.6	0.7	0.7	0.4	0.058	0.042

# C-1.6 Surface Water Data

**Dynamic Coupled Metal Transport-Speciation Model: Application to Assess a Zinc-Contaminated Lake.** Bhavsar, S. P., Diamond, M.L., Gandhi, N., and Nilsen, J. 2004. Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry, Vol. 23, No. 10, pp. 2410-2420.

<u>Objective</u>: To apply the coupled metal transport and speciation/complexation model (TRANSPEC) to examine seasonal variations in zinc dynamics and to predict long-term zinc concentrations in the water column and sediment of Ross Lake.

Summary: Ross Lake is a relatively shallow lake comprised of two basins. The north basin receives treated alkaline effluent overflow through Flin Flon Creek from tailings ponds. Water flows from the north basin to the south basin through a channel and eventually flows to Ross Creek to downstream lakes. Although current loadings of zinc to Ross Lake are estimated to be between 25 and 50 kg/day, historic levels from the 1930's to the 1950's were approximately 1,000 to 1,250 kg/day. Ross Lake also received an unknown amount of raw sewage from the 1930's to the early 1950's. Average zinc concentrations in sediment cores from the north basin were 40,000  $\mu$ g/g in the top 5 cm and 100,000  $\mu$ g/g in the following 20 cm. The highest concentration of 150,000 µg/g was found at 18 cm. Within the south basin, concentrations in the top 5 cm were 20,000 to 70,000 µg/g in the following 20 cm. The highest concentration of 110.000 µg/g was found at 15 cm. The profile for copper was similar to that observed for zinc. Concentrations of zinc in the water column varied seasonally with a minimum of 0.4 to 0.5 mg/L in winter (December to February) and a maximum of 1.2 to 1.3 mg/L in fall (September to November). Within the water column, 80 to 90% of zinc is in the dissolved phase. During the fall season when surface sediments are oxic, the dissolution of Zn increases pore water concentrations and results in an increase in diffusive flux from sediment to water. This flux is reduced somewhat by the binding of zinc in pore water to the colloidal phase that has a lower mass transfer coefficient.



**Development of a Coupled Metal Speciation-Fate Model for Surface Aquatic Systems.** Bhavsar, S.P., M.L. Diamond, M.L., Evans, L.J., Gandhi, N., Nilsen, J., and Antunes, P. 2004.

Objective: To report on the development of a coupled chemistry fate model (TRANSPEC) for

surface water that uses the multispecies fugacity/aquivalence concept to predict fate.

Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry, Vol. 23, No. 6, pp. 1376- 1385.

<u>Summary</u>: The model was used to predict the fate of zinc in Ross Lake. Findings indicate that Ross Lake has shifted from being a net sink to a source of zinc despite reduced organic loadings from sewage and decreased loadings from mine tailings. Remobilization of zinc from sediments is causing increased metal concentrations in lake water. During the summer months when conditions in the surficial sediments are anoxic, there is a net water-to-sediment diffusion of zinc. However, in fall, when conditions in surficial sediments are oxic, this process is reversed and more soluble forms of zinc exist.

# Metal Mining Environmental Effects Monitoring. FFTIS and Trout Lake Mine Initial Monitoring Program. Final Report. Stantec Consulting Ltd. June 2005.

<u>Objectives</u>: The EEM was completed to evaluate the effects of mine effluent on fish, fish habitat and the use of fisheries resources.

<u>Information Relevant to the HHRA</u>: Surface water samples were collected from reference and exposure areas associated with the Flin Flon tailings impoundment system (FFTIS) discharge (the North Weir) and the Trout Lake mine discharge, both of which discharge into Flin Flon Creek. Maximum surface water concentrations from exposure areas (E) (at or downstream of the discharge areas) and reference areas (R) (similar characteristics to the exposure areas but unaffected by the discharge) are presented in Table C-21. Samples were collected in September 2004.

Table C-21	Maximum Surface Water Concentrations Measured in Areas Affected by HBMS Discharge and Selected Reference Areas (µg/L)										
Chemical	Beaver Dam Creek (R)	North Weir (E)	Flin Flon Creek (R)	Flin Flon Creek (E)	Ross Creek (E)	Phantom Lake (R)	Schist Lake (E)				
Aluminum	216	81	101	90	762	87	84				
Arsenic	4.4	3.1	3.9	4	5.8	7.9	3.4				
Cadmium	2.15	1.19	1.88	2.18	7.9	0.2	1.2				
Copper	242	80	89	79	237	9	86				
Iron	360	640	640	700	1,440	150	800				
Mercury	< 0.05	<0.05	< 0.05	<0.05	0.1	0.06	0.05				
Molybdenum	0.3	10.7	9.7	9	6.3	7	11				
Nickel	2	7	7	8	5	3	7				
Lead	5.5	2.2	2.8	2.4	15.6	3.2	2.2				
Zinc	610	330	390	480	920	140	280				

Fractionation and Aqueous Speciation of Zinc in a Lake Polluted by Mining Activities, Flin Flon, Canada. Evans, L. J. 2000. Water, Air, and Soil Pollution 122: 299-316.

<u>Objective</u>: To analyze the content of heavy metals in surface water and sediments in Ross Lake and Flin Flon Creek and to determine the forms of zinc found in sediments.

<u>Information Relevant to the HHRA</u>: Although previous studies have indicated the presence of metals at elevated concentrations primarily related to the deposition of smelter emissions, levels



in Ross Lake are more likely related to direct discharge from the tailings ponds. As part of the current study, surface water and sediments were sampled in April, June, July, and September of 1996 at five sites in Ross Lake and one site in Flin Flon Creek.

Table C-22	Table C-22      Concentrations of Metals (µg/L) Found in Surface Waters of Ross Lake and Flin Flon Creek <sup>a</sup>								
Chemical	Ross Lake	Flin Flon Creek							
Cadmium	10.4	3.88							
Cobalt	1.71	1.47							
Chromium	0.86	0.77							
Copper	185	30.5							
Iron	712	1350							
Manganese	80.4	104							
Molybdenum	5.26	5.90							
Nickel	23.1	29.5							
Lead	12.3	2.56							
Vanadium	3.06	3.24							
Zinc	928	459							

Concentrations represent the higher of the averages for samples taken in April, June, July and September.

Analysis of metals in sediments indicated that zinc was primarily in the form of zinc sulphide.

**Ross-Schist Lake Limnological Survey 1994 Final Report.** Hudson's Bay Mining and Smelting Environment Department.

<u>Objective</u>: To measure physical, chemical and biological conditions within the Ross-Schist Lake system.

<u>Summary</u>: Ross Lake receives water from Flin Flon Creek and surface runoff from the surrounding area. Water drains from Ross Lake to the northwest arm of Schist Lake *via* Ross Creek. Schist Lake is a central basin composed of four elongated arms. Water from Schist Lake drains to Lake Athapapuskow *via* Schist Creek. In addition to chemical analysis of metals in sediments, surface water, and fish tissue, physical parameters such as secchi depth, temperature, dissolved oxygen, conductivity and pH were measured. The mean pH of Ross and Schist Lakes were 7.79 and 8.42, respectively.

Heavy metal analyses are presented as extractable values, whereas arsenic and mercury are presented as total values. The laboratory detection limits for cadmium, lead, and mercury were all above the MSWQC. Concentrations of zinc from both lakes exceeded the MSWQCs.

Table C-23	le C-23 Surface Water Chemistry Data for Ross Lake (mg/L)										
Chemical		# Samples	Maximum	Mean	MSWQC <sup>a</sup>						
Copper		9	<0.01	<0.01	0.02						
Zinc		9	1.14	0.95	0.047						
Iron		9	0.25	0.2	1.0						
Cadmium		9	<0.01	<0.01	0.002						
Lead		9	<0.04	<0.04	0.0077						
Nickel		9	<0.01	<0.01	0.16						
Mercury		4	<0.0002	<0.0002	0.000006						
Arsenic		6	0.004	0.004	0.190						
Hardness (CaCO3	)	9	942.2	839	-						

Bolded values highlighted in grey are in excess of the MSWQC. Bolded non-detect values are in excess of the MSWQC.

<sup>a</sup> The MSWQC were based on the former Manitoba Surface Water Quality Objectives (1988) that have been replaced by the Manitoba Water Quality Standards, Objectives, and Guidelines (2002).

а



Table C-24	Surf	ace Water Chemistry Data for Schist Lake (mg/L)									
Chemical		# Samples	Maximum	Mean	MSWQC <sup>a</sup>						
Copper		54	0.02	0.01	0.02						
Zinc		54	0.34	0.05	0.047						
Iron		54	0.16	0.04	1.0						
Cadmium		54	<0.01	<0.01	0.002						
Lead		54	<0.04	<0.04	0.0077						
Nickel		54	<0.01	<0.01	0.16						
Mercury		5	<0.0002	<0.0002	0.000006						
Arsenic		54	0.002	0.002	0.190						
Hardness (CaCC	)3)	54	638	402	-						

Bolded values highlighted in grey are in excess of the MSWQC. Bolded non-detect values are in excess of the MSWQC.

The MSWQC were based on the former Manitoba Surface Water Quality Objectives (1988) that have been replaced by the Manitoba Water Quality Standards, Objectives, and Guidelines (2002).

**Douglas Lake Surface Water Data (1993).** Saskatchewan Environment, Environmental Protection Branch. Provided by George Bihun, Environmental Officer.

<u>Summary</u>: Saskatchewan Environment provided a spreadsheet with various water chemistry data. Concentrations of metals are provided for Douglas Lake opposite the Creighton WTP. The most recent data are from August 1993 as summarized in the following Table. Only concentrations of arsenic and zinc were found above the laboratory detection limit.

Table C-25	Concentrations of Total Metals in Surface Water of Douglas Lake in August 1993					
Chemical		Concentration (µg/L total)				
Arsenic		8				
Cadmium		<1				
Copper		<1				
Lead		<5				
Molybdenum		<5				
Selenium		<1				
Silver		<1				
Zinc		82				

## C-1.7 Blueberry Data

Monitoring for Mercury and Lead in Blueberry Plants (*Vaccinium myrtilloides (Michx*)) of the Flin Flon area, 1980 and 1981. McEachern, D.B., and Phillips, S.F. 1983. Terrestrial Standards and Studies, Environmental Management Services Branch, Department of Environment and Workplace Safety and Health. Report 83-12. December, 1983

<u>Objective</u>: To determine the levels of mercury (Hg) and lead (Pb) contamination in blueberries and soil in the primary areas of pollution dispersal from the Hudson Bay Mining and Smelting (HBMS) complex.

<u>Summary</u>: This study involved the sampling of blueberry components (berries: washed and unwashed, leaves, stems, roots) and the surface organic soil layer from 11 sites up to a 40 km distance from the HBMS complex in 1980 and 1981. The sampling sites were located to the northeast and southeast of the smelter. These were selected based on the predominant wind direction (towards the east and southeast) and accessibility to berry pickers. Data was presented in both wet weight (ww) and dry weight (dw), but the paper focused on the wet weight (dw standardized to 70% water content: ww = dw\*0.3) on the basis that this form is eaten.



Data suggested that Hg does not accumulate in blueberry fruit. The mercury content of the blueberries ranged from 0.02 to 0.04 µg/g (wet weight, washed and unwashed) and did not exceed background levels (0.02 to <0.04  $\mu$ g/g) (Table C-26), or the maximum acceptable dietary concentration established by the Canadian Food and Nutrition Board (0.05  $\mu$ g/g). In 1980 and 1981, washed blueberry concentrations (dw) ranged from < 0.02 to  $< 0.1 \mu g/g$  and background ranged from <0.03 to <0.07 µg/g. Unwashed berry concentrations (dw) ranged from 0.06 to 0.13  $\mu$ g/g and background concentrations ranged from 0.07 to 0.09  $\mu$ g/g (Table C-28).

	Flon Manitoba at Select Distances from the HBMS Complex										
			Washed				Unwashed				
			1980		1	1981		1980		1981	
Dispersion Sector <sup>b</sup>	Distance (km) <sup>c</sup>	Site No.	Dry	Wet	Dry	Wet	Dry	Wet	Dry	Wet	
N-NE	2	11	<0.02	< 0.04	<0.09	< 0.03	0.1	0.03	0.09	0.03	
N-NE	4.6	8	< 0.03	< 0.04	<0.07	< 0.02	0.11	0.03	0.06	0.02	
N-NE	3.2	10	< 0.05	< 0.04	<0.08	<0.02	0.13	0.04	0.08	0.02	
E-SE	3.7	9	< 0.03	< 0.03	<0.08	< 0.02	0.1	0.03	0.08	0.02	
E-SE	5.1	1	< 0.02	< 0.03	<0.07	< 0.02	0.12	0.03	0.07	0.02	
E-SE	8.9	2	< 0.03	< 0.04	<0.10	< 0.03	0.12	0.03	0.1	0.03	
E-SE	15.5	3	< 0.02	< 0.04	<0.06	< 0.02	0.13	0.03	0.06	0.02	
E-SE	38.9	4	< 0.03	< 0.04	<0.07	< 0.02	0.09	0.03	0.07	0.02	
SE-E	2.5	7	< 0.04	< 0.04	<0.08	< 0.02	0.12	0.04	0.08	0.02	
SE-E	5.8	5	< 0.03	< 0.04	<0.09	< 0.03	0.11	0.03	0.09	0.02	
SE-E	19.6	6	< 0.02	< 0.04	<0.06	< 0.02	0.1	0.03	0.06	0.02	

#### Table C-26 Mercury Concentrations ( $\mu q/q$ , wet and dry weight)<sup>a</sup> in Blueberries in Flin

Wet weight value is adjusted to 70% water content. Wet weight = dry weight x 0.30h

The wind direction followed a directional gradient with highest levels to the east and southeast

Distance from the HBMS Complex

There were no significant differences between the samples in close proximity to the mining and smelting complex and the control (39 km SE), samples in the prevailing wind direction and those that were not, and washed compared to unwashed blueberries.

An exponential decline between distance from the smelter and Hg concentrations in the soil, leaves, stems, and roots suggested that the smelter was the source of Hg. The influence of the wind was demonstrated with an even stronger exponential relationship in the samples that lay in the prevailing wind direction. Concentrations were most elevated at sites within 5 km of the smelter, and were similar to background (Site 4) at sites beyond 15 km. Concentrations of Hg in soil exceeded levels found in blueberry components. No analysis was conducted in regards to the uptake of Hg from the soil by the blueberry components.

Levels of Pb in the blueberries ranged between 0.52 to  $2 \mu q/q$  (ww), and exceeded the background levels (0.19 to 0.57µg/g ww) (Table C-27). In general, washed berries had lower levels of Pb than those unwashed, however, levels remained above background (Site 4). The blueberry Pb concentrations exceeded the average level of Pb in berries in Canada (0.05  $\mu$ g/g). The Pb concentrations in the blueberries at the background site (Site 4) were close to the Canadian average (1/4 exceedance in dry weight concentrations). The study alluded to the WHO TDI for Pb (430  $\mu$ g/day), and the Canadian guideline for fresh fruit (7  $\mu$ g/g) presently under review, but no conclusions were made in regards to whether consumption of the blueberries was safe. The data was forwarded to the Food Directorate of Health and Welfare Canada for further assessment in relation to dietary guidelines.



Table C-27	Table C-27 Lead Concentrations (µg/g, wet and dry weight) <sup>a</sup> in Blueberries in Flin										
	Flon M	anitoba a	t Select	Distanc	es from	the HBN	IS Com	nplex			
Leastien				Was	hed			Unwa	shed		
Location			19	980	19	981	19	80	19	81	
Dispersion Sector <sup>b</sup>	Distance (km) <sup>c</sup>	Site No.	Dry	Wet	Dry	Wet	Dry	Wet	Dry	Wet	
N-NE	2	11	2.3	0.69	4.3	1.29	3.4	1.02	7.7	2.31	
N-NE	4.6	8	2.6	0.77	4.1	1.23	4.9	1.47	4.5	1.26	
N-NE	3.2	10	1.6	0.49	-	2	3.5	1.31	4.9	1.48	
E-SE	3.7	9	5	1.5	2.4	0.71	5	1.5	2.4	0.72	
E-SE	5.1	1	4.5	1.35	1.8	0.54	5.2	1.57	3.9	1.18	
E-SE	8.9	2	1.9	0.58	2.5	0.75	2.1	0.63	2.4	0.72	
E-SE	15.5	3	1.8	0.54	2.3	0.69	2.1	0.6	2.1	0.63	
E-SE	38.9	4	0.61	0.19	1.9	0.57	0.94	0.29	1.6	0.48	
SE-E	2.5	7	1.8	0.66	2.4	0.72	2.7	0.81	2.3	0.7	
SE-E	5.8	5	2.1	1.36	2.1	0.62	2.2	0.66	1.9	0.57	
SE-E	19.6	6	1.7	0.52	1.9	0.57	1.7	0.51	2.1	0.63	

<sup>a</sup> Wet weight value is adjusted to 70% water content. Wet weight = dry weight x 0.30

The wind direction followed a directional gradient with highest levels to the east and southeast

<sup>c</sup> Distance from the HBMS Complex

Lead concentrations in the blueberry fruit were the lowest compared to the other components, and levels in the soil were the highest (soil>stem>roots>leaves>fruit). Authors speculated that the stem accumulated Pb through the leaves and roots (which absorbed Pb from soil). No analysis was conducted to verify these pathways.

A decline in Pb concentrations with distance occurred for all of the blueberry components. The most pronounced decline occurred in the samples located between 10 and 15 km, and declined to background levels beyond 15 km.

The possible risk to wildlife from grazing of the blueberry components was not assessed in this study. Overall, declining levels of Pb and Hg in blueberry components and soil implicated the smelter as a source of these chemicals. Hg did not accumulate in the blueberry fruit beyond acceptable levels. Pb did accumulate in blueberries, albeit at lower levels than found in other blueberry components. Washing the blue berries reduced Pb levels.

<u>Comments</u>: The data was interpreted on an observational basis using tables and graphs. However, statistics were not performed to evaluate the significance of trends. For example, the exponential decay of metal levels with distance; wind as a significant a factor: difference between concentrations in predominant wind direction and not. The study mentioned the WHO TDI for lead, and that the Canadian TDI was under review. However, the study did not did not use the data to estimate whether the TDI was exceeded (using average levels in diet, or correcting for body weight).

#### Other Relevant Information:

- A reference is made to the average level of lead in Canadian berries (0.05 µg/g) from the Nutrition Foundation (1982);
- Raw data for washed and unwashed berries (wet and dry weight), leaves, stems, roots, and soil is presented (wet weight). This information could potentially be used to derive uptake factors; and,
- This study was conducted to as a follow-up to recommendations made in a previous study (Wotton, 1979) which reported elevated levels of Hg and Pb in blueberries from an area 2.5 km southeast of Flin Flon (Louis Lake Area).



A Survey of Mercury and Lead in Vaccinium myrtilloides (Michx.) of the Flin Flon Area. Wotton, D.L. 1979. Manitoba Department of Mines, Natural Resources and Environment, Environmental Research and Development Branch. Report 79-3: 17pp. 1979.

<u>Objective</u>: To investigate levels of mercury (Hg) and lead (Pb) in blueberry plants in the vicinity of the HBMS Complex.

<u>Summary</u>: Blueberry fruit and plant components (leaves, stems, roots, and surface soils) were sampled at nine locations at varying distances (2.5 to 38.1 km) from the HBMS Complex (herein referred to as the smelter). The majority of the sites (7) were located in the primary dispersal direction (S, SE). A sample site located 38.1 km SE of the smelter (Site 4) was considered to be a control site. Dry and wet weight concentrations were reported, but the report focused on the dry weight values in the discussion.

Dry weight concentrations of mercury in berries (0.02 to 0.17  $\mu$ g/g) exceeded the acceptable dietary concentration published by Canadian Food and Nutrition Board (0.05 $\mu$ g/g) at five of the nine sampling locations (Table C-28). Concentrations were similar to those measured at two of the sites in a 1978 survey by the Canadian Wildlife Service. The sites with concentrations (dry weight) similar to background (0.02  $\mu$ g/g, Site 4) were located 5.1 km E (Site 1), 3.7 km and 15.5 km SE (Site 3), and 14.6 km S (Site 6) of the smelter.

Table C-28 Mei Flir Sm	Table C-28    Mercury Concentrations (µg/g, wet and dry weight) in Blueberries in      Flin Flon Manitoba at Select Distances from the Hudson Bay Mining and      Smelting Complex									
Dispersion Sector	Distance (km) <sup>b</sup>	Site No.	19	1978						
a			Dry	Wet	Dry (unwashed)					
E	5.1	1	<0.02	<0.06	-					
SE	8.9	2	0.08	0.02	-					
SE	15.5	3	0.03	<0.02	-					
SE	38.1	4	0.02	<0.02	0.02					
S	5.8	5	0.12	0.03	-					
S	14.6	6	0.05	<0.02	-					
S	2.5	7	0.16	0.03	0.22					
N	4.6	8	0.17	0.05	-					
SE	3.7	9	0.04	<0.02	-					

<sup>a</sup> The wind direction followed a directional gradient with highest levels to the east and southeast <sup>b</sup> Distance from the HBMS Complex

The Pb concentrations were reported in dry weight. There were no discernible differences in the concentrations of the washed and unwashed berries, with concentrations ranging from 1.18 to 2.12  $\mu$ g/g, and from 1.16 to 2.43  $\mu$ g/g, respectively (Table C-29). Concentrations were similar to those of background (<1.2 to <1.25 $\mu$ g/g). The Pb concentration measured in a 1978 survey at site 7 (7.0  $\mu$ g/g) significantly exceeded the concentration reported in this study at the same site (1.23  $\mu$ g/g). The lead levels measured in this study did not exceed the maximum allowable concentration by the U.S. Food and Drug Administration (7  $\mu$ g/g).

Table C-29	Lead Concentrations (µg/g, dry weight) in Blueberries in Flin Flon Manitoba at Select Distances from the HBMS Complex								
Dianaraian	Diatamaa			Dry Weig	ght				
Dispersion	(km) <sup>b</sup>	Site No.	19	79	1978 <sup>c</sup>				
Sector			Washed	Unwashed	Unwashed				
E	5.1	1	2.12	1.94	-				
SE	8.9	2	1.96 1.92		-				
SE	15.5	3	<1.21	1.16	-				

Appendix C: Literature Review, Data Gap Analysis, and Supplemental Data Human Health Risk Assessment of Flin Flon, Manitoba, and Creighton, Saskatchewan



Table C-29	Table C-29Lead Concentrations (µg/g, dry weight) in Blueberries in Flin FlonManitoba at Select Distances from the HBMS Complex					
Disporsion	Distance (km) <sup>b</sup>	Site No.	Dry Weight			
Sector <sup>a</sup>			1979		1978 <sup>c</sup>	
			Washed	Unwashed	Unwashed	
SE	38.1	4	<1.2	<1.25	N.D.	
S	5.8	5	<1.21	1.97	-	
S	14.6	6	2.42	2.43	-	
S	2.5	7	<1.24	1.23	7	
N	4.6	8	1.18	2.4	-	
SE	3.7	9	1.92	2.17	-	

<sup>a</sup> The wind direction followed a directional gradient with highest levels to the south and southeast

<sup>b</sup> Distance from the HBMS Complex

<sup>c</sup> Data reported by the Canadian Wildlife Service in a 1978 survey in Sites 4 and 7

A general trend of declining Hg and Pb concentrations with increasing distance from the smelter was observed in the study, however, no statistically significant patterns were measured.

Concentrations of Twenty-Eight Elements in Fruiting Shrubs Downwind of the Smelter at Flin Flon, Manitoba. Shaw, G. 1981. Environmental Pollution (Series A) 25: 197-209.

<u>Objective</u>: To determine the extent of pollution from the smelter stack located in Flin Flon and its potential impact on wildlife by measuring the concentrations of 28 elements in three different plant species located at three locations ranging from 2.9 to 36.2 km southeast of the stack

<u>Summary</u>: The concentrations of 28 elements in the (unwashed) leaf, berry, and stem components of three shrubs common in the Flin Flon area were measured: blueberry (*Vaccinium myrtilloides*), manzanita (*arctostaphylos*), and the bog cranberry (*Vaccinium vitis-idaea*). Measurements were taken in 1978 at three sites (Louis Lake, Mystic Creek, and Cranberry Portage) located 2.4 km, 26.5 km, and 36.2 km southeast of the smelter, respectively. Concentrations of As, Se, Hg, Pb, Cu, Fe and Zn were substantially greater at the site in closest proximity to the smelter (Louis Lake) compared to the two sites located beyond 25 km of the smelter (Mystic Creek and Cranberry Portage) (Table C-30). Statistical analyses showed good accuracy and precision of the data. Overall, the berries had the lowest elemental concentrations compared to the other plant components (leaves, stems).

Table C-30Concentrations (µg/g, dry weight) of Various Elements in Blueberries in Flin Flon Manitoba at Select Distances from the Hudson Bay Mining and Smelting Complex						
		Sample Locations <sup>a</sup>				
Chemical	Louis Lake (2.4km SE)	Mystic Creek (26.5km SE)	Cranberry Portage (36.2km SE)			
AI	35	17	22			
Ва	10.5	11.2	8.6			
Be	ND	ND	ND			
Cu	21.1	3.7	3.7			
Fe	150	24.2	31.8			
К	10,200	7,430	7,240			
Mg	390	593	630			
Mn	62.4	171	23.4			
Na	300	ND	ND			
Р	1,080	920	1,000			
Pb	7.0 - 7.26 <sup>b</sup>	ND	ND			
Hg	0.22	0.01	0.02			
Sr	1.75	ND	ND			

Appendix C: Literature Review, Data Gap Analysis, and Supplemental Data Human Health Risk Assessment of Flin Flon, Manitoba, and Creighton, Saskatchewan



Table C-30	able C-30 Concentrations (µg/g, dry weight) of Various Elements in Blueberries in Flin Flon Manitoba at Select Distances from the Hudson Bay Mining and Smelting Complex					
		Sample Locations <sup>a</sup>				
Chemical	Louis Lake (2.4km SE)	Mystic Creek (26.5km SE)	Cranberry Portage (36.2km SE)			
V	ND	23	17			
Zn	24	ND	ND			
Ag	0.5	ND	15			
Cd	ND	ND	ND			
Со	ND	ND	ND			
Cr	3.8	1.7	ND			
Мо	ND	ND	ND			
Ni	ND	ND	ND			
Zr	ND	ND	ND			
Ti	1.8	0.9	0.7			
Th	ND	ND	ND			
Si	1.8	ND	ND			
As	1.74 - 2.0 <sup>b</sup>	0.31	0.16			
Se	<0.2 - 0.22 <sup>b</sup>	<0.03	0.07			

<sup>a</sup> One sample was taken at each location

Concentrations reported by two different labs (n=2)

Highlighted rows indicate elements with greater concentrations at Louis Lake compared to Mystic Creek and Cranberry Portage.

<u>Comments</u>: Berries were unwashed, and concentrations are assumed to be reported in dry weight (no wet weight conversion was applied).

Manitoba Conservation Blueberry Study. Manitoba Conservation. 2000. (Unpublished).

Summary: Blueberry fruit samples were collected from 13 locations at distances ranging from 1.95 to 155 km from the HBMS smelter (Table C-31). Three replicates were taken at each site. All vegetation concentrations were based on analysis of a dried sample, and were washed. Mercury concentrations were all <0.01  $\mu$ g/g. Lead concentrations ranged from <0.01 to 0.3  $\mu$ g/g. Two of the sites reported concentrations ranging from 0.2 to 0.3 $\mu$ g/g. The first site was located 1.95 km NNE of HBMS smelter on the east side of railroad tracks. The second was located 2.51 km SSE of HBMS smelter on golf course road. The remaining eleven sites had concentrations <0.01  $\mu$ g/g. Four of these sites were located within 5 km of the smelter (2 ESE, NNE, NE) and seven were located up to 155 km from the HBMS smelter.

Table C-31      Concentrations of Lead and Mercury in Blueberries from the Flin Flon        Area      Area				
Location	Date Sampled	Moisture %	Pb (μg/g)	Hg (µg/g)
TQ0151	08/15/2000	84.1	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0151	08/15/2000	84.2	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0151	08/15/2000	84.7	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0152	08/15/2000	85.4	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0152	08/15/2000	82.5	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0152	08/15/2000	85.2	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0153	08/16/2000	83.4	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0153	08/16/2000	82	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0153	08/16/2000	83.3	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0154	08/16/2000	85	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0154	08/16/2000	77.8	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0154	08/16/2000	84	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0155	08/15/2000	84.2	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0155	08/15/2000	84.9	< 0.1	< 0.01



Table C-31	Concentrations of Lead and Mercury in Blueberries from the Flin Flon        Area			
Location	Date Sampled	Moisture %	Pb (µg/g)	Hg (μg/g)
TQ0155	08/15/2000	83.8	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0156	08/15/2000	82.9	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0156	08/15/2000	82.4	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0156	08/15/2000	81.5	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0157	08/15/2000	85.5	0.2	< 0.01
TQ0157	08/15/2000	83	0.3	< 0.01
TQ0157	08/15/2000	83.3	0.2	< 0.01
TQ0158	08/15/2000	83.6	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0158	08/15/2000	84	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0158	08/15/2000	83.5	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0159	08/15/2000	84.3	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0159	08/15/2000	84.2	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0159	08/15/2000	85.8	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0160	08/15/2000	83.9	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0160	08/15/2000	84.6	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0160	08/15/2000	83.2	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0161	08/15/2000	78.7	0.3	< 0.01
TQ0161	08/15/2000	85.9	0.2	< 0.01
TQ0161	08/15/2000	85.4	0.2	< 0.01
TQ0162	08/15/2000	81	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0162	08/15/2000	81.8	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0162	08/15/2000	79.6	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0163	08/17/2000	82.2	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0163	08/17/2000	82.5	< 0.1	< 0.01
TQ0163	08/17/2000	82.2	< 0.1	< 0.01

## References

- Bhavsar, S. P., Diamond, M.L., Gandhi, N., and Nilsen, J. 2004. Dynamic Coupled Metal Transport-Speciation Model: Application to Assess a Zinc-Contaminated Lake. Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry, Vol. 23, No. 10, pp. 2410-2420.
- Bhavsar, S.P., M.L. Diamond, M.L., Evans, L.J., Gandhi, N., Nilsen, J., and Antunes, P. 2004. Development of a Coupled Metal Speciation-Fate Model for Surface Aquatic Systems. Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry, Vol. 23, No. 6, pp. 1376- 1385.
- Carlson, R.W., Bazzaz, F.A., Stukel, J.J., and Wadding, J.B. 1976. Physiological effects, wind reentrainment, and rainwash of lead aerosol particulate deposited on plant leaves. Env Sci Technol 10: 1139- 1142. Cited In: Pip, 1991.
- Evans, L. J. 2000. Fractionation and Aqueous Speciation of Zinc in a Lake Polluted by Mining Activities, Flin Flon, Canada. Water, Air, and Soil Pollution 122: 299-316.
- Fraser, W.W. 1983. Presentation with respect to discharges to the atmosphere from Flin Flon, Manitoba metallurgical operations of Hudson Bay Mining and Smelting Co. Ltd. Presentation to Manitoba Clean Environment Commission, December 1983. 38 p. Cited In: Harrsion *et al.*, 1989.
- Franzin, W.G. 1984. Aquatic contamination in the vicinity of the base metal smelter at Flin Flon, Manitoba, Canada – a case history. *In* Environmental Impacts of Smelters. Edited by J.O. Nriagu. John Wiley and Sons, New York, pp. 523-550. Cited In: McMartin *et al.*, 1999.



- Franzin, W.G., McFarlane, G.A., and Lutz, A. 1979. Atmospheric fallout in the vicinity of a base metal smelter at Flin Flon, Manitoba, Canada. Environmental Science and Technology, 13(12): 1513- 1522. Cited In: Henderson *et al.*, 1998.
- Franzin, W.G., and McFarlane, G.A. 1980. An analysis of the aquatic macrophyte, <u>Myriophyllum</u> <u>exalbescens</u>, as an indicator of metal contamination of aquatic ecosystems near a base metal smelter. Bull. Environ. Contam. Toxicol. 24: 597-605. Cited In: Harrison *et al.*, 1989.
- Franzin, W.G., and McFarlane, G.A. 1981. Elevated Zn, Cd, and Pb concentrations in waters of ice-covered lakes near a base metal smelter during the snow melt, April 1977. Environ. Pollut. Ser. B Chem. Phys. 2: 11-19. Cited In: Harrison *et al.*, 1989.
- Harrison, S.E., M.D. Dutton, R.V. Hunt, J.F. Klaverkamp, A. Lutz, W.A. Macdonald, H.S.
  Majewski, and L.J. Wesson. 1989. Metal Concentrations in Fish and Sediment from Lakes near Flin Flon, Manitoba. Canadian Data Report of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences No. 747. Department of Fisheries and Oceans, Winnipeg, Manitoba.
- Harrison, S.E., and J.F. Klaverkamp. 1990. Metal Contamination in Liver and Muscle of Northern Pike (*Esox lucius*) and White Sucker (*Catostomus commersoni*) and in Sediments from Lakes near the Smelter at Flin Flon, Manitoba. Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry. Vol. 9, pp.941-956.
- HBMS. 1994a. Heavy Metals in Flin Flon Area Gardens. Hudson Bay Mining and Smelting (unpublished 1994)
- HBMS. 1994b. Ross-Schist Lake Limnological Survey 1994 Final Report. Hudson's Bay Mining and Smelting Environment Department (unpublished 1994).
- Henderson, P.J. 1995. Surficial geology and drift composition of the Annabel Lake- Amisk Lake area, Saskatchewan (NTS 63L/9, and part of 63K/12 and K/13). Geological Survey of Canada, Open File 3026. Cited In: McMartin *et al.*, 1999.
- Henderson, P.J., and McMartin, I. 1995. Mercury Distribution in Humus and Surficial Sediments, Flin Flon, Manitoba, Canada. Water, Air, and Soil Pollution 80: 1043-1046.
- Henderson, P.J., McMartin, I., Hall, G.E., Percival, J.B., and Walker, D.A. 1998. The chemical and Physical Characteristics of Heavy Metals in Humus and Till in the Vicinity of the Base Metal Smelter at Flin Flon, Manitoba, Canada. Environmental Geology 34 (1).
- Hogan, G.D., and Wotton, D.L. 1984. Pollutant distribution and effects in forests adjacent to smelters. Journal of Environmental Quality, 13(3): 377-382. Cited In: Henderson *et al.*, 1998.
- Jackson, T.A. 1978. The biogeochemistry of heavy metals in polluted lakes and streams at Flin Flon, Manitoba, Canada, and a proposed method for limiting heavy-metal pollution of natural waters. Environ. Geol. 2: 173-189. Cited In: Harrison *et al.*, 1989.



- Jackson, T.A., 1984. Effects of inorganic cadmium, zinc, copper, and mercury on methyl mercury production in polluted lake sediments. Evidence for selective inhibition and stimulation of microbial species based on variations in heavy metal tolerance. In J.O. Nriagu, ed., Environmental Impacts of Smelters. John Wiley and Sons, New York, NY, pp. 551-578. Cited In: Harrsion and Klaverkamp, 1990.
- Johnson, M.G. 1987. Trace elements loadings to sediments of fourteen Ontario lakes and correlations with concentrations in fish. Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci. 44: 3-13. Cited In: Harrsion and Klaverkamp, 1990.
- Jones, G., and V. Henderson. 2006. Metal Concentrations in Soils and Produce from Gardens in Flin Flon, Manitoba, 2002. Manitoba Conservation, April 2006. Report No. 2006-01.
- Manfreda, J., and Sabesky, I. 1987. Flin Flon: a review of environmental and health data. Manitoba Department of Environment, and Workplace Safety and Health, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Cited In: Pip, 1991.
- Manitoba Conservation. 2000 (Unpublished). Manitoba Conservation Blueberry Study.
- Manitoba Conservation. 2003 (Unpublished). Manitoba Conservation Forest Sites Soil Data (1998/1999 and 2003).
- Manitoba Conservation. 2007. Concentrations of Metals and Other Elements in Surface Soils of Flin Flon, Manitoba and Creighton, Saskatchewan, 2006. Manitoba Conservation. Report No. 2007-01.
- McEachern, D.B. and S.F. Phillips. 1983. Monitoring for Mercury and Lead in Blueberry Plants (*Vaccinium myrtilloides* (*Michx*)) of the Flin Flon area, 1980 and 1981. Terrestrial Standards and Studies, Environmental Management Services Branch, Department of Environment and Workplace Safety and Health. Report 83-12. December, 1983. Cited In: Pip, 1991.
- McFarlane, G.A., and Franzin, W.G. 1978. Elevated heavy metals: a stress on a population of white suckers <u>Catostomus commersoni</u>, in Hamell Lake, Saskatchewan. J. Fish. Res. Board Can. 35: 963-970. Cited In: Harrison *et al.*, 1989.
- McFarlane, G.A., and Franzin, W.G. 1980. An examination of Cd, Cu, and Hg concentrations in livers of northern pike, <u>Esox lucius</u>, and white sucker, <u>Catostomus commersoni</u>, from five lakes near a base metal smelter at Flin Flon, Manitoba. Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci. 37: 1573- 1578. Cited In: Harrsion and Klaverkamp, 1990.
- McFarlane, G.A., Franzin, W.G., and Lutz, A. 1979. Chemical analysis of Flin Flon are lake waters and precipitation: 1973- 1977. Can. Fish. Mar. Serv. Manuscr. Rep. 1486: v + 42 p. Cited In: Harrison *et al.*, 1989.
- McMartin, I., Henderson, P.J., Nielsen, E., and Campbell, J.E. 1996. Surficial geology, till and humus composition across the Shield Margin, north-central Manitoba and Saskatchewan: geo-spatial analysis of a glaciated environment. Geological Survey of Canada, Open File 3277. Cited In: McMartin *et al.*, 1999.



- McMartin, I., Henderson, P.J., and E. Nielsen. 1999. Impact of a Base Metal Smelter on the Geochemistry of Soils of the Flin Flon Region, Manitoba and Saskatchewan. Can. J. Earth Sci. 36: 141-160.
- Nutrition Foundation. 1982. Assessment of the Safety of Lead and Lead Salts in Food. A Report of the Nutrition Foundation's Expert Advisory Committee, June, 1982. Cited In: McEachern and Phillips, 1983.
- Pip, E. 1991. Cadmium, Copper, and Lead in Soils and Garden Produce near a Metal Smelter at Flin Flon, Manitoba. Bull. Environ. Contamin. Toxicol. (1991) 46: 790-796.
- Saskatchewan Environment. 1993. Douglas Lake Surface Water Data (1993). Saskatchewan Environment, Environmental Protection Branch. Provided by George Bihun, Environmental Officer.
- Shaw, G. 1981. Concentrations of Twenty-Eight Elements in Fruiting Shrubs Downwind of the Smelter at Flin Flon, Manitoba. Environmental Pollution (Series A) 25: 197-209.
- Sim, B.L., Frederik, P., Agterberg, P., and Beaudry, C. 1999. Determining the Cutoff Between Background and Relative Base Metal Smelter Contamination Levels using Multifractal Methods. Computers and Geosciences 25: 1023-1041.
- Stantec. 2005. Metal Mining Environmental Effects Monitoring. FFTIS and Trout Lake Mine Initial Monitoring Program. Final Report. Stantec Consulting Ltd. June 2005.
- Steiness, E., and Njastad, O. 1993. Reasons for enrichment of metals in the organic surface layer of natural soils. *In* Proceedings, 9<sup>th</sup> International Conference on Heavy Metals in the Environment. Edited by R.J. Allan and J.O. Nriagu. CEP Consultants Ltd., Edinburgh, U.K., Vol. 2, pp. 226-229. Cited In: McMartin *et al.*, 1999.
- Stevenson, F.J. 1994. Humus chemistry: genesis, composition, reactions. John Wiley and Sons Inc., Toronto. Cited In: McMartin *et al.*, 1999.
- Van Loon, J.C., and Beamish, R.J. 1977. Heavy metal contamination by atmospheric fallout of several Flin Flon area lakes and the relation to fish populations. J. Fish. Res. Board Can. 34: 899-906. Cited In: Harrison *et al.*, 1989.
- Wotton, D.L. 1979. A survey of Mercury and Lead in Vaccinium myrtilloides (Michx.) of the Flin Flon Area. Manitoba Department of Mines, Natural Resources and Environment, Environmental Research and Development Branch. Report 79-3: 17pp. 1979.
- Zoltai, S. 1988. Distribution of base metals in peat near a smelter at Flin Flon, Manitoba. Water, Air, Soil Pollution (37): 217- 228. Cited In: Henderson *et al.*, 1998.